

Appendix 1 The Accretion Theory of the Analects

Inconsistencies within the Analects have usually been explained in such a way as to allow all parts of the text to be regarded as close to Confucius, and thus as valid sources for his life and thought. A typical theory is that different chapters were compiled by different disciples, variations in content being attributed to individual disciple interests or levels of understanding. Jǜng Sywǎn (died c200) suggested Rǎn Yǜng, Dž-yóu, and Dž-syà;¹ other versions exist. Such *monolithic* theories keep the compilation of the text within living memory of Confucius. Lyǝu Dzǜng-ywǎn (773–819) noted that Dzǜng Shǜm² is called Dzǜngdž “Master Dzǜng” in the work, implying that his disciples had a role in its compilation, and placing it the second, not the first, disciple generation.³

Later scholars have gone on to suggest what amounts to an evolutionary view of the text.⁴ The first such suggestion was made by Hú Yín (1098–1156),⁵ who noted that the last ten chapters, LY 11–20, are formally less well organized than the first ten, LY 1–10. This sets up an “upper and lower” division of the Analects, and at least leaves open the possibility of a time lag between them.

Itō Jinsai (1627–1705) further argued that LY 10 (presumed to be a portrait of Confucius) was meant to end the work, and that LY 11–20, with longer narratives and frequent use of numerical categories (such as the “Three Dangers” of LY 16:7), which are not found in LY 1–10, was a later continuation.⁶

Tswēi Shù (1740–1816) noticed that some of the traits characterizing LY 11–20 are concentrated in the last half of that span: LY 16–20.⁷ In his later writings,⁸ he pointed out further features of this later Analects style, including inconsistencies, improbabilities, and an excessive degree of formality between Confucius and his followers. Tswēi thus in effect distinguishes a *very* late layer, LY 16–20, within the previously identified Hú/Itō *late* layer, LY 11–20.

¹Jǜng Sywǎn 421. It may be relevant that these are the only disciples who have the last word in an Analects debate with the Master; see LY 6:2, 17:3, and 3:8. LY 1:15 is a literary reworking of 3:8, and not (at any rate from our point of view) a fourth case.

²曾參; the -m distinguishes him from his second son Dzǜng Shǜn 曾申.

³Lyǝu Byèn 1/68–69. This brief essay by a member of the Hǎn Ywǎ circle might be said to mark the beginning of critical Analects scholarship.

⁴Fung **History** 1/19f (compare Nivison **Chang** 119–120), Taam **Studies** 165, Pokora **Pre-Han** 30, and Cheng **Lun Yǜ** 314; contrast Schwartz **World** 61–62.

⁵The “Hú” cited in Jū **Jí Jù** ap LY 16:11 is frequently construed as the much better known Hú Ān-gwó 胡安國 (1074–1138), but is unambiguously identified as his nephew Hú Yín 胡寅 in Jū **Yǜ-lèi** 19:9r (2/705); for Yín’s career, see **Sǜng Shǐ** 435 (6/24201).

⁶Itō **Kogi** 2, Spae **Itō** 178–179. The upper/lower distinction is acknowledged as cogent in Yang **Note** 313–314 (1957), and underlies the discussion in Hú **Byèn-jǜng** (1978). Itō’s disciple Dazai Shundai, however (**Kokun** 5/3r ap LY 9:7, 7/8 ap LY 14:1; **Gaiden** 1/2rv), reverted to a two-compiler theory, featuring Chín Jǎng and Ywǎn Syèn.

⁷Tswēi **Yǜ Shwō** 21–24.

⁸Tswēi **Byèn Yí** 25–33, collecting material from Tswēi’s **Kǎu-syǜn** studies. For other summaries, see Hummel **Eminent** sv Ts’ui Shu; Lau **Analects** 264–268.

Arthur Waley (1889–1966) agreed that the Tswēi Shù layer, LY 16–20, was late. Within the Hú/Itō “upper” Analects, LY 1–10, he saw LY 10 as irrelevant, and noted that Dz̄vngdž is quite differently characterized in LY 1 and LY 8. Waley concluded that LY 3–9 were the earliest portion of the text.⁹

As noticed by Pokora,¹⁰ these theories are not mutually exclusive, but will *combine to form a single conjecture*. To Waley’s LY 3–9 core, we add LY 1–2 and 10 to get the Hú/Itō early layer LY 1–10, then the middle layer LY 11–15 distinguished by Tswēi, and finally his latest layer, LY 16–20, to make up the Hú/Itō “lower” Analects, and the entire work. In schematic form, with chapter numbers in **bold** marking the new additions at each stage, we would have:

03 04 05 06 07 08 09
01 02 03 04 05 06 07 08 09 **10**
 01 02 03 04 05 06 07 08 09 10 **11 12 13 14 15**
 01 02 03 04 05 06 07 08 09 10 11 12 13 14 16 **16 17 18 19 20**

This four-stratum theory brings us to the verge of an *accretion hypothesis* for the text.

Another Route

We may also begin with the three Analects texts listed in the Hàn palace library catalogue, HS 30. These were the Lǔ and Chí texts (presumably transcribed from the memory of Lǔ and Chí scholars after the 0191 Hàn lifting of the 0213 Chí ban on Confucian writings), with 20 and 22 chapters,¹¹ and the Gǔ or old-script text, on which our present text is based, supposedly recovered in the c0154 demolition of a building near the former Lǔ palace which may have housed the Lǔ school.¹² This had 21 chapters, with “two Dž-jāng [chapters].” That is, besides LY 19, which begins with “Dž-jāng asked,” *another* chapter had that initial phrase. This would be true of our present text if LY 20:1, a composition in Shū style, were separate, and LY 21 began with 20:2, a Dž-jāng question. We infer that this *was* the case, and that the difference is merely one of division: Lǔ and Gǔ *contained the same material*.

HS 30 names the two extra Chí chapters: Asking About Kingship 問王¹³ and Knowing the Way 知道. These suggest nothing in the present text, and imply new material; that is, the Chí text *has grown beyond* the Lǔ text.¹⁴ If the Lǔ Confucians were quiescent after the 0249 conquest of Lǔ,¹⁵ but the Chí Confucians remained active until the 0221 conquest of Chí, then the longer period of activity in Chí, plus an assumption of continuous growth, will explain the greater length of the Chí text.

⁹Waley *Analects* 21.

¹⁰Pokora *Pre-Han* 30.

¹¹A damaged copy of a pre-055 Hàn bamboo text close to the Lǔ version was found in a tomb in Dìng-syèn (**Jyèn-bàu** 10; sample transcriptions in **Shh-wǔn**); it is currently (1997) being translated by Roger G. Ames and Henry Rosemont, Jr. A more eclectic Lǔ text was engraved on stone in 175–183; extant fragments are collected in Ma **Shí Jīng**.

¹²Pelliot **Chou King** discredits this story as involved with the old-script Shū forgery; Brooks **Controversies** argues that the Analects aspect rests on a basis of fact.

¹³Or, Asking About the Jade 問玉; JSDW 15 (30v) has “Kingship.”

¹⁴The Chí Analects also had additional material in the portion corresponding to the 20 (or 21) chapters of the Gǔ version; see again JSDW 15 (30v).

¹⁵As is implied by the departure of the Lǔ school head to Ngwèi; see 20r, above.

This latter hypothesis implies a *rate* of growth, for the late 03c Chí Analects, of two chapters in 28 years, or about 14 years per chapter. Assuming constant growth at that rate, the 19 full chapters of the Lǚ Analects imply a beginning 266 years *before* 0249. This would reach back to 0515: within the lifetime of Confucius.

This rough initial projection can be refined by considering other evidence. Nothing in the Analects is spoken directly by Confucius (his sayings are introduced by the third-person formula “The Master said” 子曰), hence none of these sayings can have been written down before his death in 0479.¹⁶ Taking that as the earliest date for the core chapter, the other 18 chapters to be distributed over the 230 years until 0249 give an average time span of 12.7 years per chapter, or half the average 25-year *birth* generation (*transmission* generations average 40 years). That is, the Lǚ Analects seems to have accumulated at an average rate of 2 chapters per generation. This version of the hypothesis thus implies that the beginnings of the Analects may indeed go back to a point of contact with the historical Confucius (a possibility doubted by several recent scholars),¹⁷ and that the *typical* leader of the school, whether later leaders succeeded by birth or were designated by their predecessors, contributed not one, but more than one, chapter module to the accumulating text.

Combining the Theories

It is common to both versions of the theory, and to many other such theories not here mentioned,¹⁸ that the chapter, either singly or in clusters, is the basic unit of accretion. The Pokora synthesis suggests that the natural attachment point for accretions is at the tail of the text, with a few chapters also being placed in front of the previous material. And the inference from the HS 30 entries is that the time depth of the text may be considerable: on the order of centuries rather than years.

These suggestions together define the hypothesis that there is an earliest core of the work, perhaps a single chapter, going back to just after the death of Confucius in 0479, and (if the Pokora synthesis is in the right general direction) within the Waley early layer LY 3–9; specifically, at or near the beginning of that layer. This directs attention to the first two Waley chapters, LY 3 and 4.

Of them, LY 4 has several seemingly early features. The LY 4 sayings are the shortest in any Analects chapter (they average 19 words, against 30 for the text as a whole, and 123 for the seemingly late LY 20 fragment). All but two of them begin with a “The Master said” incipit, a simplicity unique in the work. Literary devices found in other chapters (disciple questions, dialogues, narrative settings, transitions) are lacking in LY 4. And, except for two passages (which also have other anomalies), no other persons are named in LY 4:¹⁹ the focus is exclusively on the Master.

¹⁶The traditional date. Maspero **Antique** 376n1 / **Antiquity** 449n1, approved by Waley (**Analects** 16n2, 79) and Riegel (**Review** 791), argues for c0450. One difficulty which this addresses (too few descendants of Confucius are listed in SJ 47 to cover the school headship from 0479 to Hàn) is otherwise resolved by the present theory, which recognizes *disciples rather than descendants* as the early leaders of the movement.

¹⁷For example, Waley **Analects** 25; Tsuda **Rongo** 240–291.

¹⁸For example, Kimura **Kōshi** 473f, Takeuchi **Rongo** 192f, Lau **Analects** 273f.

¹⁹Tsuda **Rongo** 272f notes that LY 4 uniquely lacks ancient-sage references and similar anachronisms, though he does not himself draw the indicated inference.

The idea of a memorial, occasioned by Confucius's death in 0479, gives a likely motive for the nucleus. Its literary technique is little removed from the forms of writing that would have been known as of that year: bronze inscriptions and bamboo-slip chronicle entries. This makes LY 4 not only unique in the Analects, but unique *in a way that would be plausible for an early 05c core text*.

Some linguistic details support this identification. Lǚ dialect s̄斯 “then” occurs (but along with the standard dzv 則 “then”), as would be expected in sayings of Confucius, who by tradition was born in the Lǚ capital area. Very striking is the occurrence of the full verb yw 於 “be in relation to” (4:5), whereas other chapters have only the coverb yw “in relation to.” Coverbs in general derive from full verbs, thus you 由 “follow” > you “from.” An original verb may continue in use along with its derived coverb, but verbal yw is virtually unknown in Warring States texts.²⁰ Notable too is verbal chū 處 “take one's place in” (4:1–2, 4:5): the rest of the text uses the noun chù 處 “place,” but replaces the verb with jyw 居 “dwell.”

Thus, not only is LY 4 *distinctive* within the text, but some of its features imply *greater linguistic age* than the rest of the text, in agreement with the idea that these sayings were spoken to, and remembered by, Confucius's protégés. These points support the conclusion that LY 4 is, or contains within it, the original core of the Analects compilation, around which the remaining portions of the text were added by a process of accretion over time.

Later Material in LY 4

All the *formal* exceptions to the above descriptions cluster in two sayings. One is 4:15, which not only names Dzvngdž but *features him as a speaker*. This is so unusual in LY 4 that it is very likely an interpolation. And LY 4:26 not only features, but *is a saying of*, Dž-yóu; this too is presumably a later addition.²¹

It emerges from further study that the early *linguistic* features cited above occur *only in the area 4:1–17*, never in 4:18–25. Also, the standard word dzv 則 “then” in 4:21 conflicts dialectically with the Lǚ usage s̄斯 “then” in 4:7. We may then conservatively suspect that 4:18–25 are an extended later addition.

Finally, LY 4:1–17 and 4:18–25 appear to belong to different stages within the long-term shift from postverbal (F) to preverbal (B) position for various types of adverbial expression (a linguistic process which is still not quite complete at the present time), and the induced shift toward verbs instead of nouns as sentence final elements. Of the 48 predicates in 4:1–17, a total of 39 end with a verb object or other noun element (81% *nominal endings*), while the 15 predicates of 4:18–25 have 40% *nominal endings*. This tends to confirm a later date for 4:18–25, leaving the sixteen sayings of 4:1–14 plus 4:16–17 as the probable nucleus.

²⁰Nivison **Hampers** notes an inscription on lacquer from the tomb of the Lord of Dzvng (closed after 0443), one line of which reads 日辰於維 “the sun's [zodiacal space] is in the [winter-spring] corner.” It is possible that this seeming prayer was cast in an archaic style, and that full verbal 於 was obsolete in the west also by the mid 05c.

²¹Given the Dzvngdž interpolation *4:15, one wonders if Dž-yóu was also esteemed as a leader of the school. LJ 2 supports this; see page 210 below. That interpolations might be added without disturbing previous text is implied by the format of the Hàn copy of the Lǚ Analects, which tends to begin a strip with the *first* words of a passage, and leave the rest of the slip blank after the *last* words of a passage (see **Shr-wvn** 49).

The Overall Chronology of the Analects

We now have a theory that the LY 4 core dates from 0479 and LY 20 from 0249, and that all other chapters, including the three which now precede LY 4, are from intermediate dates. We next ask whether any of these chapters can plausibly be dated *within that time span*. The following details deserve consideration:

- LY 6:3 first uses the posthumous epithet of Aī-gūng (d 0469), and so must have been written **after 0469**, whereas LY 4 and 5 might still be before 0469.
- LY 8:3 portrays the death of Dzṽngdž (d 0436); it cannot be earlier than, and was probably written **in or shortly after 0436**. LY 7 should then be before 0436.
- LY 9:15 (cf 7:14) turns from Chí to Wèi for ceremonial models, and may reflect a diplomatic shift which might have been motivated by the battles between Chí and Lǔ in 0412, 0411, and 0408. Allowing some time to establish this new alliance, a plausible date for at least those portions of LY 9 might be **c0405**.
- LY 12–13 articulate values close to those urged by Mencius in the interviews recorded in MC 1. Mencius studied in the Lǔ Confucian school; these chapters look like a source, or an early school version, of his ideas. Since his career outside Lǔ began in c0320,²² his last date in Lǔ would be c0321. LY 12 might moderately, and LY 13 closely, precede this year, perhaps **c0326** and **c0322**.
- LY 16:1 protests a pending outrage (nominally, a Jì clan attack on the nearby town of Jwān-yŵ) which suggests the Chí destruction of Sùng in 0286; it thus might be from **c0287**. LY 16:2–3 seem to be dynastic curses whose logic is based on the number of generations since the usurpation of power by the Tyén clan in Chí; they may plausibly be seen as Lǔ denunciations following the actual Chí conquest of 0286. This portion of the chapter might therefore date from **c0285**.
- LY 17:4 and 17:6 are about service under an illegitimate ruler. There are no known usurpations in the Lǔ line, but it can be inferred²³ that in 0272 the King of Chǔ reduced the status of the Lǔ ruler (from Prince/gūng to Lord/hóu), giving Chǔ a dominant role in Lǔ internal affairs. This could easily raise a legitimacy issue for Lǔ officials. LY 17 might then be from shortly afterward, **c0270**.
- LY 18:5–7 resemble, and probably respond to, passages in the Jwāngdž anthology, regarded as being generally of mid-03c date. In content, LY 18 resolves the LY 17 service dilemma, and probably follows LY 17 at no very great interval. We may tentatively assign it to a point halfway between LY 17 and 19, or **c0262**.
- LY 19 seems to include veiled criticism of Syŵndž, and may follow the Chǔ partial conquest of Lǔ in 0255, and Syŵndž's installation as Director (Ling 令) in Lán-ling (in southern, occupied Lǔ) in 0254. It may thus be from **c0253**.
- LY 20 appears to have been interrupted in mid-compilation; one plausible interruption would be the Chǔ conquest and absorption of northern Lǔ in **0249**.

No one of these implied dates is decisive, but together they are surely suggestive: whether based on absolute “outside” events or on relative “internal” relations, they occur *in consecutive chronological order* as they stand in the chapter sequence of the present text, supporting the hypothesis that chapters from LY 4 through LY 20 represent a linear growth process in which each chapter is a separate accretion unit: a module of growth.

²²Lau **Mencius** Appendix 1.

²³From details which seem to survive embedded in SJ 15 and 33 (Brooks **Princes**).

The Proposed Chapters, LY 1–3

Of this parallel set of accretions, which by hypothesis were added in the order LY 3–2–1, we may similarly note the following:

- LY 3 is on the subject of public ritual, a seeming advance over the rules of personal protocol in LY 10 (further developed in LY 11); it may thus follow both. Several passages (3:1–3, 3:6, 3:10) denounce the usurpation of royal usages in public ritual. An event which might have provoked this sense of outrage is the Chí ruler’s usurpation of the Jōu title “King” (wáng 王). The SJ chronology is known to be defective in this area, and the BA gives no direct information. Interpreting the SJ claim of a *rulership* change in 0342 as instead a *reign* change, and noting that this is the year after Chí’s victory in the battle of Mǎ-líng (given by BA as 0343), we may assign the Chí kingship to 0342. The date of those passages in LY 3 which seem to respond to this event would then most plausibly also be **c0342**.

- LY 2 contains (in 2:1) astral symbolism of a type usually associated with Chí thought (it is found also in seemingly early parts of the Gwǎndž), and implies Chí influence of the sort noted above in LY 12–13. Since such cosmological symbols are not found in LY 12–13, LY 2 must postdate the later of them (LY 13, c0321). In content, LY 2 may be described as in part a development of the Mencian or proto-Mencian populism of LY 12–13. The rulership symbol in 2:1 suggests a summary prepared, sometime after c0321, for a ruler of Lǔ. One plausible occasion for such a presentation would be the accession of Lǔ Píng-gūng in **0317**.

- LY 1 reflects a Confucian group *out of power* (1:1) and thus emphasizes the social, rather than the governmental, utility of its doctrines (1:2, 1:6, 1:8). It thus probably follows the politically engaged chapters LY 14–15. Since it does not show the formal traits of the Tswēi Shū late layer, it must precede the earliest Tswēi Shū chapter, LY 16 (c0287–0285). The exit of the Confucians from power in Lǔ may well have been a result of court changes imposed after the reduction of Lǔ to vassalage under Chǔ after the death of Píng-gūng (0303) and the establishment of the puppet ruler Wǎn-hóu in 0302. This would imply for LY 1 an *earliest* date (terminus a quo) of c0302, the actual chapter, allowing some time to establish the new basis of the school, being perhaps somewhat later: **c0294**.

Like those suggested above for LY 4–20, none of these proposed dates is inevitable, but the fact that all appear *in reverse sequence* supports the hypothesis of an outward accretion, in the order LY 3–2–1, from the presumed LY 4 core.

The Final Hypothesis

The two chapter sequences can now be interleaved to give a detailed accretion hypothesis. Beginning with the LY 4 core (c0479), we would have: LY 5–6 (the latter c0460), 7–8 (the latter c0436), 9 (c0405), 10–11–3 (the last c0342), 12 (c0326) 13 (c0322), 2 (c0317), 14–15–1 (the last perhaps c0294), 16 (some passages from c0287–0285), 17 (c0270), 18 (c0262), 19 (c0253), and 20 (0249). Dates for the remaining chapters can be proposed by interpolation in the above scheme: LY 5 at c0473, LY 7 at c0450 (toward the middle of Dzǎngdž’s headship), LY 10 at c0380 and 11 at c0360, spacing them out evenly over the early 04c, and LY 14 and 15 at c0310 and c0305, leading to the end of Píng-gūng’s reign.

This hypothesis not only *incorporates* but *explains* Waley’s remark about changes in the Dzǎngdž persona between LY 8 (early) and LY 1 (mythically late) and Tswēi Shū’s observations of formal irregularities in the last five chapters, which on this view turn out to be from the 03c. It will be assumed as true in what follows.

Text Additions

Since accretions are most easily made at the *end* of a text, *preposed* chapters are exceptional. These seem to come at points of external (the Chí kingship; LY 3) or internal stress (the accessions of Lǚ Píng-gūng and Wǎn-hóu; LY 2 and 1), which might well have evoked a special statement or reaction from the Lǚ Confucians. This external logic may be behind the front placement of LY 1–3, which may have been topical manifestoes rather than routine evolutions. We will presently find that several interpolated *passages* seem also to have a high-profile intent.

The Pairing of Sayings

Earlier commentators have noted close relations between specific pairs of Analects sayings, though it has not been appreciated that such pairing, admittedly often based on trivial features, characterizes *the entire text*, giving a background against which disruptive interpolated sayings can be relatively easily recognized. Thus LY 4:15, already suspect as featuring a speaker other than Confucius, becomes further suspect in that *it separates two closely paired sayings*:

- 4:14 Confucius: Care not for office, but **only whether you deserve it**
 4:15 (Dzǔngdǔ explains a cryptic saying of Confucius)
 4:16 Confucius: Emphasize not advantage, but **only what is right**

The rhetorical parallel between 4:14 and 4:16 is obvious.²⁴ So is the substantive parallel: both express an ethic of obligation rather than a systematic philosophy, whereas 4:15 purports to give a basic principle linking *all* Confucius's sayings.

Complementing the pairing principle is the section principle: pairs of sayings (sometimes ending with a single unpaired saying) tend to be arranged in sections with a thematic or other coherent unity.²⁵ This unity also has value as an aid in the detection of extraneous material. Interpretatively, it helps us to see into the mind of the chapter compiler, and to discern the common tendency that the sayings were felt to possess at the time of their composition.

We now turn to a detailed analysis of each chapter, to develop the still-rough hypothesis which we have reached by the above argument.

The Organization of Analects Chapters

In the following pages, each chapter is taken up in turn, interpolations are identified, and any indications of date noted. Relying in part on Appendix 4, suggestions are made about the compiler of the chapter, who, we assume, will normally have been the current head of the Confucian school. On each right-hand page, the layout of the chapter material (minus interpolations) – its sectional divisions and pairing patterns – will be shown schematically in an overview or *conspectus*. These explanations will serve to develop the accretion theory, and also to show how the selection of sayings in the main translation was arrived at.

²⁴Symmetrical pairing and twinning also recur constantly as structural principles in Warring States art, as may be seen in the illustrations on pages 20, 50, and 78.

²⁵This sectioning principle has been noticed in LY 4 by Lau **Analects** 269f, and in other places by earlier commentators. As far as we know, we are the first to propose that sectioning, like the pairing of sayings, is a *pervasive structural device* in the Analects.

LY 4

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text has **26 passages** for LY 4, none of which suggest subdivision.

Interpolations. All but two of the 26 passages are introduced by a “The Master said” (Dǔ ywē 子曰) formula, a sparseness of style (and absence of narrative rhetoric) unparalleled in any other chapter. This leads to the inference that this is the oldest chapter, and also to the suspicion that the few exceptional passages are intrusive. The exceptions include the only speeches by named persons. One of them (4:26) is actually *attributed* to another speaker, Dǔ-yóu, and 4:15 is in effect also a disciple saying: it ends with Dǔyngdǔ interpreting a cryptic saying of the Master. 4:26 is in the chapter-final position, a likely place to attach an interpolation. 4:15 betrays itself by interrupting an evidently intentional pair of sayings emphasizing deserving rather than getting. On these independent formal grounds, 4:15 and 4:26 should be excluded as interpolations. Another series of interpolations is identified below.

Language and Form. LY 4 contains several unique or (in the case of the verb yǔ 於) archaic usages, which independently suggest that it is early within the text. But these usages are confined to the range 4:1–17; they are absent, and at points contradicted, in the following 4:18–25. It thus seems that 4:18–25 are also an interpolation, albeit a carefully crafted one keeping the *formal*, if not the *linguistic*, features of 4:1–17 (minus *4:15): relative brevity, narrative simplicity, and the invariable Dǔ ywē incipit. The 4:18–25 sayings emphasize domestic and personal virtues, in sharp contrast with the official focus of 4:1–17, and were presumably added to legitimize a later doctrinal shift in that direction. Removing them leaves an original chapter comprising **16 passages**, which readily fall into four topical groupings: a first section (4:1–7) on the virtue rǎn, and less well defined ones on dào (the Way; 4:8–10), rival value systems (4:11–13), and the effort to acquire the sort of virtue that is a qualification for office (4:14–17).²⁶

Pairing of sayings is sometimes based merely on repeated words (chǔ 處 “abide” in 4:1–2; wù 惡 “hate” in 4:3–4) and sometimes on parallel ideas (the dedicated man’s superiority to death and shame in 4:8/9; the emphasis on deserving in 4:14/16). Unpaired single passages at the end of thematic sections tend to have a summative or envoi function. The logic of this design might not convince a modern editor, but it seems to be present in the material. It quite possibly influenced the arrangement, and perhaps even the selection, of the chapter materials.

Date. Archaic traits in some sayings suggests that LY 4 is not merely the Analects nucleus, but that it may preserve Confucius’s own literal words, as remembered by his followers. If so, the most readily imaginable occasion for its compilation will have been early in the mourning period after his death in **0479**.

Compiler. No organized “school” is implied by the LY 4 sayings (compare the bickering in LY 5); Confucius would then have left behind simply his individual protégés. MC 3A4 says that Dǔ-gùng mourned for Confucius for six years, not the conventional three. This role among the disciples, though perhaps mythically elaborated, suggests **Dǔ-gùng 子貢** as the compiler of the LY 4 memorial, which subsequently grew, by repeated extension, into our Analects.

²⁶Lau **Analects** 269–270 agrees with the first grouping but diverges thereafter; his sections are 4:1–7, 4:8–9, 4:10–17, 4:18–21, and the remainder, 4:22–26.

[Original Chapter]

[A. The Cardinal Virtue Rǎn 仁]

- 1 It is good to **abide** in rǎn
- 2 Only the rǎn man can **abide** extreme situations
- 3 The rǎn man knows what to **hate**
- 4 The rǎn man will not **hate** anybody
- 5 One must put rǎn above **desire**
- 6 Nobody now loves rǎn with **passion**
- 7 One notes faults only to recognize the associated type of rǎn

[B. The Public Context: Dào 道]

- 8 One who hears that the dào obtains **will not mind death**
- 9 One who is set upon the dào **will be superior to shame**
- 10 The gentleman in relation to the tyēn-syà

[C. The Gentleman and His Opposite]

- 11 Preference for **local or special situations** marks the unworthy man
- 12 Official actions based on **personal advantage** will arouse resentment
- 13 Government based on **propriety and deference** is the only option

[D. Preparation for Office]

- 14 Care not whether you get office, but whether you **deserve** it
- 16 Emphasize not advantage, but only **what is right**
- 17 Learn from both the worthy and the unworthy

[Later Extension]

[Filial Duty]

- 18 One may differ with parents **but must accept their judgement**
- 19 One may travel away from parents **but must not go far**
- 20 One should maintain a father's ways for three **years** (nyén) of mourning
- 21 One should be aware, either way, of the **ages** (nyén) of parents

[Keeping One's Word]

- 22 The old-timers **said little** lest fulfilment should not match promise
- 23 Few now err in **too strict** an adherence to their given word
- 24 A gentleman will be slow to promise but diligent to perform

[Chapter Envoi]

- 25 Virtue is not solitary; it must have neighbors

LY 4 Conspectus

(Including the 4:18–25 addendum)

LY 5

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text contains 28 sayings, of which two can be subdivided: 5:10 with its second “The Master said” formula, and 5:19 with its parallel internal structure. It is easy to see why these closely related sayings were later combined as one, but it is more fruitful to recognize them here as paired rather than single elements. Dividing them (as 5:10a/10b and 5:19a/19b) gives a total of **30 passages** in the received text of the chapter.

Interpolations. The use of pairing to detect interpolations is complicated by the fact that LY 5 turns out to employ, in its middle two sections, a *double* pairing structure, where each saying relates through one link to the *preceding* saying, and through another to the *following* saying.²⁷ 5:7, however, evidently interrupts 5:6/8, 5:16 interrupts 5:15/17, 5:22 interrupts 5:21/23, and 5:26 interrupts 5:25/27. The closeness of the pairing that results when these passages are removed confirms their intrusiveness. For the consecutive 5:13–14, we rely on content: they are respectively a saying of Dž-gùng rather than Confucius (note that both the intrusive passages in LY 4 were also disciple sayings), and a description rather than a quotation (again violating the otherwise consistent literary texture of this chapter and of LY 4). Removing these six doubtful sayings leaves **24 passages** to be accounted for as presumptively original material.

Language and Form. Thematically, these cluster into a symmetrical structure of 3-9-9-3 sayings, analogous to the elaborate double pairing already noted. The chapter is concerned throughout with judgements of persons, and the principle of thematic division seems to be by the category of persons judged: (A) relatives and outsiders, (B) protégés, (C) historical figures, and (D) Confucius himself. LY 5D emphasizes self-cultivation; it may have been intended as structurally parallel to the last section of the original LY 4, where a similar note was sounded.

Date. There is no direct evidence. The atmosphere of a school for *aspirants* implies a stage somewhere between LY 4 (advice to *individuals*) and LY 6 (advice to *officeholders*). If Dž-gùng was the leading figure in the period immediately after Confucius’s death, then the late MC 3A4 (see above), which gives him that role for six years, may reflect historical fact. The Dž-gùng interlude might then occupy 0479–0474, the next phase would begin c0473, and LY 5 can be dated at **c0470**.

Compiler. Criticism of Dž-gùng (5:4, 5:9, 5:12) eliminates him as the compiler of LY 5 (the implied tension makes sense if he was the *previous* leader of the group). Candidates for the headship of the first organized group are few. Those whose names occur in LY with the suffix -dž “Master,” like Dzṽngdž and Yóudž, suggest a somewhat more formalized stage. Among other possibilities, **Dž-yóu** 子游 stands out: a saying of his (4:26) was interpolated (with one of Dzṽngdž’s, 4:15) in LY 4, which if still remembered as the text core would have been a place of honor. The first head of the organized school would need official experience, and of protégés credited in the next layer (LY 6) with official experience, Dž-yóu is the only one praised for his conduct in office. Finally, this office was in Wǔ-chǎng, which was controlled by the legitimate Prince, so that Dž-yóu would presumably have been acceptable to the legitimist LY 5 group.

²⁷The two series are separately listed at the left and right of the conspectus opposite. We are indebted to Dennis Grafflin (**Structure**) for sharing his findings on LY linking.

[A. Confucius's Family and Rival Mentors]

Gūngyě Cháng	1	[is unlucky but blameless
Nán Rúng	2		is circumspect but worthy
Dž-jyèn	3		↳ is cultivated

[B. The Original Protégés]

Dž-gùng	4	[is at least elegant
Rǎn Yūng, though not rǎn enough	5		is at least straightforward
Chīdyāu Kāi, though not syèn enough	6	[is allowed to take office
Dž-lù, though said not to be rǎn	8		is recommended for office
Dž-gùng is said not to be quick	9	[and implicitly scolded
Indolent Dzǎi Yw	10a		is not worth scolding
Specious Dzǎi Yw	10b	[did not live up to his promise
Shv̄n Chv̄ng, claimed to be steadfast	11		did not justify his reputation
Dž-gùng is vain of his empathy	12	↳ and cannot live up to his ideal	

[C. Exemplary Personages]

Kūng Wv̄ndž is cultured	15	[despite vulgar experience
Yèn Píng- jùng is punctilious	17		despite long acquaintance
Dzàng Wv̄n- jùng 's knowledge	18	[does not guarantee propriety
[Triple] detachment	19a		does not attest rǎn
[Triple] departure	19b	[does not qualify Chv̄n Wv̄ndž
Excessive circumspection	20		does not avail Ji Wv̄ndž
Foolish fidelity	21	[is shown in extreme crisis
Proverbial loyalty	23		is shown in ultimate suffering
Proverbial honesty	24	↳ is not after all flawless	

[D. Confucius on Self-Improvement]

Confucius emulates	25	[others' virtues
Confucius finds none correcting	27		their own faults
Confucius is eminent	28	↳ only in self-improvement	

LY 5 Conspectus
(Showing double pairing)

LY 6

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 6 contains **30 passages**, none of them seeming to require subdivision.

Interpolations. Of the 30, 6:17 interrupts a pair of sayings about external qualities, 6:15 (on modesty) falls thematically between 6:14 (summing up a series of sayings on official fitness) and 6:18 (one of a pair on surface qualities), and 6:24 falls between the closely linked pairs 6:22/23 (contrasting *rín* and *jì*) and 6:25/26 (based on verbal puns). 6:27 (on acquiring the qualities of a *jiwǎndǔ*) seems to end a series on that topic, implying a final section like those noted in LY 4 and LY 5. On formal grounds, then, 6:15, 6:17, and 6:24 appear to be interpolations. The last three sayings, 6:28–30, relate neither to the final-section theme of acquiring virtues nor very obviously to each other. They are placed at the vulnerable chapter end, and are thus also intrinsically suspect by position. 6:28 is on a meeting between Confucius and a Wèi princess, 6:29 refers to the Jūng Yūng, a text with Mencian affinities and thus probably of 03c date, and 6:30 refers to Yáu and Shùn, otherwise unknown in what seem to be early texts. Eliminating these six passages leaves a total of **24 passages** in LY 6, the same as in LY 5 (and the number to which LY 4 was brought up by the 4:18f extension). The 24-passage form was to become standard for later Analects chapters. What, if anything, the number 24 may have symbolized we must leave as a subject for speculation.

Form. The four thematic sections partly parallel those in LY 5: (A) fitness for office, (B) judgements of the original protégés, (C) the harmony of virtues, and (D) the acquisition of virtues. These in turn form two clusters, A/B and C/D, the first section of each containing 3 sayings (the overall form is 3-11-3-7). The elaborate type of double-pairing which we observed in LY 5 does not seem present in LY 6, so that a different authorial hand may be suspected.

Date. LY 6 deals with problems encountered in office and not merely with the acquisition of office, and so may reflect an advanced stage of the Analects school. A notable feature of LY 6 is its larger self-cultivation section: LY 4 and LY 5 devoted their last 3 sayings to this subject, which in LY 6 takes up the last 7 sayings. There is an implied terminus post quem: 6:3 quotes Aī-gūng by that posthumous name, and therefore must date from after his death in 0469. There is nothing in LY 6 (such as systematic hostility to Dž-yóu or to any other plausible previous head of the school) to imply an abrupt transition from LY 5, and the LY 6 hint of responsible positions held by certain disciples suggests a significant passage of time since LY 5. A dating in the vicinity of **c0460** would be consistent with these considerations.

Compiler. It was noted above that the honorific names Yǒudǔ and Dzǎngdǔ may imply a position as heads of the school in the period *after* LY 5. Of the two, Dzǎngdǔ is shown surrounded by disciples in LY 8, and was thus probably head as of the preceding LY 7. This leaves LY 6 as the possible province of Yǒu Rǔò 有若 or Yǒudǔ 有子. Later tradition implies that Yǒudǔ was either disliked or resented.²⁸ This would explain the few sayings attributed to him in the text, and the lack of an interpolated saying in LY 4 (an honor accorded to both Dž-yóu and Dzǎngdǔ). Like the hostility toward Dž-gùng in LY 5, this suggests a headship either stormy in itself, or later disavowed by the school tradition.

²⁸For a positive reading of some of the later evidence, see Lau *Analects* 260–261.

[A. Fitness for High Office]

- 1 Confucius feels that **Rǎn Yūng** could hold a responsible position
- 2 Confucius agrees with **Rǎn Yūng** about laxness in a leader
- 3 Only dead **Yén Hwéi** really had the will to improve himself (< 5:28)

[B. Judgements In and Out of Office]

- 4 Rǎn Chyóu **improperly grants** excessive travel allowance
- 5 Ywǎn S̄z **improperly refuses** unneeded salary allowance
- 6 Rǎn Yūng described as **worthy though humble**
- 7 Yén Hwéi said to be **r̄vn though poor**
- 8 **Jī Kāngdǔ** inquires about employability of three disciples (< 5:8)
- 9 **Jī clan** rejected as an employer by Mǐn Dǔ-chyēn (< 5:5)
- 10 **Tragic illness** of worthy Rǎn Gv̄ng
- 11 **Lyrical poverty** of worthy Yén Hwéi
- 12 **Faint-hearted Rǎn Chyóu** gives up without exerting himself
- 13 **Vulgar Dǔ-syà** expends energy on the wrong subject
- 14 Dǔ-yóu discovers a punctilious official subordinate

[C. The Balance of Qualities]

- 16 **Showy qualities** necessary in practical life (reverses 5:25)
- 18 **Showy qualities** must however be balanced by inner substance
- 19 Inner integrity is the very life of man

[D. Acquiring the Qualities of the Gentleman]

- 20 Taking pleasure in truth is the **highest** of three stages
- 21 Openness to the appeal of virtue is the **higher** of two types of men
- 22 **Jī and r̄vn contrasted**: questions of Fán Chǐ
- 23 **Jī and r̄vn contrasted**: metaphor of mountains and rivers
- 25 **Pun** (gū versus b̄gū) on things which lack their proper nature
- 26 **Pun** (r̄vn versus r̄vn) on degree to which good men can be deceived
- 27 Wide learning moderated by ritual propriety is enough for the gentleman

LY 7

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 7 contains 38 passages, of which 7:26 contains a second “The Master said” formula, and is probably two closely related sayings which have been later combined. Dividing it (as 7:26a/26b) gives a total of **39 passages** in the received text of the chapter.

Interpolations. Eleven of these are descriptions rather than quotations, and thus depart from the norm of the book so far. Of them, 7:4, 13, and 21 interrupt pairs of sayings (see opposite), and 7:15, 25, and 27 fall *between* pairs of sayings. These six are thus formally intrusive as well as typologically anomalous; we conclude that all eleven (the other five are 7:9–10, 18, 32, and 38) are interpolations. Two passages, 7:11 and 31, are anecdotes with narrative changes of scene, for which there is no earlier precedent. With the removal of the descriptive passages, both fall between two well-defined pairs of sayings. This anomaly of placement confirms the doubt raised by their novelty of structure, and we conclude that both are interpolations. Finally, 7:36–37, coming (given the elimination of 7:38) at the end of the chapter, do not pair with each other, nor does 7:36 pair with 7:35. 7:35 itself describes the last hours of Confucius. LY 7 as a whole, in contrast with LY 5–6, which teem with disciples, focuses largely on Confucius. It seems to have been meant as a portrait of the founder, with the 7:35 death scene, summing up his life retrospectively, as its final element. We thus conclude that 7:36–37 are later additions. Removing these fifteen passages gives a total inventory of **24 passages**, the same as in LY 5–6.

Language and Form. LY 7:5 recalls Confucius’s dreams of Jōu-gūng. Probably that part of the chapter is meant to characterize Confucius in his youth, just as 7:35 (an unpaired envoi to 7:33–34) evidently looks back on his life from its end. The pairing pattern isolates 7:6, 19, and 30 as *internal* unpaired envois, presumably marking thematic divisions (as in LY 4–6). We might expect to find these devoted to early (7:7–19) versus late (7:20–30) teaching periods. There is support for this in the youthful enthusiasm of 7:14 (on music), and the world-weary despair of 7:26a/b. In 7:23 occurs the distinctive, probably archaizing pronoun yǔ 予 (we are grateful to David Keightley for defining its archaic use as a first-person *singular* form), which also occurs in LY 8, and in both chapters occurs in contexts featuring death or the supernatural. This usage was probably based on a mistaken inference from the occurrence of the pronoun in inscriptions on preserved ritual bronze vessels, with their supernatural context. That nuance is developed further in later chapters.

Date. There are no direct indications. By its position, LY 7 follows LY 6 (c0460) and precedes LY 8 (which is dated by the portrayed death of Dzǔngdǔ to c0436). We may reasonably assign it to **c0450**, in approximately the middle of that span.

Compiler. The death of Dzǔngdǔ, portrayed in the following LY 8, makes it a first hypothesis that he was school head as of the compilation of LY 7. The LY 7 portrait of Confucius contains many novel features, and its implied date, more than a generation after his death, suggests that these novel features are inventions; their recurrence in the LY 8 Dzǔngdǔ sayings also points to Dzǔngdǔ as the likely author. The aesthetic sensibility attributed to “Confucius” in 7:14 is compatible with Dzǔngdǔ’s quotation of a poem on his deathbed in 8:3, the sacral pronoun in the supernatural protection claim of 7:23 recurs in Dzǔngdǔ’s 8:3, and the same mixture of moral strenuousness and ultimate moral confidence characterizes the two death scenes, Confucius’s in 7:35 and Dzǔngdǔ’s in 8:3. On the whole, then, the attribution of LY 7 to Dzǔngdǔ seems relatively well founded.

[A. Personal Character]

- 1 Confucius succeeds **as a transmitter**; he does not make up anything
- 2 Confucius succeeds **as a learner and teacher**; he does not weary
- 3 Confucius falls short **in learning from the good** and reforming the evil
- 5 Confucius falls short **of his early dream visions** of Jōu-gūng
- 6 Confucius's advice to beginners: Way, virtue, rún, cultural expertise

[B. Early Teaching]

- 7 Confucius has never turned away **a poor student**
- 8 Confucius will not put up with **an indolent student**
- 12 Confucius is **not distracted** from principle by chance of improper gain
- 14 Confucius is **distracted** from eating by beauty of Chí ritual dances
- 16 Confucius is **indifferent** to temptations of wealth and position
- 17 Confucius is **intent** on continuing his studies
- 19 Confucius refuses illegitimate office in favor of learning and teaching

[C. Late Teaching]

- 20 Confucius is **not a sage**: he loves the past and learns from it
- 22 Confucius is **not a snob**: he can learn from anybody in the street
- 23 Confucius **claims Heavenly invulnerability** to threat of brigand
- 24 Confucius **disclaims esoteric teaching** against doubts of disciples
- 26a Confucius despairs of meeting **a sage**
- 26b Confucius despairs of meeting **a worthy man**
- 28 Confucius is **not a sage**: he uses lower methods
- 29 Confucius is **not a snob**: he will accept any questioner
- 30 If you truly want rún, then rún is right there beside you

[D. Retrospection and Death]

- 33 Confucius **though energetic** has had no chance to show his talent
- 34 Confucius **though not a sage** has been unwearied in his teaching
- 35 Confucius's life has been in itself a sufficient prayer

LY 8

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 8 has 21 passages, of which 8:2 has a second “The Master said” formula, and may be divided as 8:2a/b. 8:20 has a triple form (two lore statements followed by a “Confucius said” formula), and may be divided as 8:20a/b/c. These divisions give a chapter total of **24 passages**.

Form and Interpolations. By the LY 5–7 precedent, 24 sayings is the full complement of a standard chapter, seemingly leaving no room for interpolations. But the five sayings 8:3–7, attributed to Dzṽngdǎ, stand out from the rest of the chapter. The first two, 8:3–4, are deathbed scenes, of which the more impressive, 8:4, in which Dzṽngdǎ is visited by the head of the Mṽng clan, is suspect as an aggrandizing interpolation. The other **4 passages** then form a plausible core.

8:2a/b pair *with each other*. 8:1, on the Jōu ancestor Tâu-bwó, is thus isolated in its immediate context, but has affinities with the ancient figures (Yáu, Shùn, Yṽ, the early Jōu kings) in 8:18–21. It seems that 8:1 and 8:18–21 are an *encapsulating* addendum, most of it appended, with one passage placed at the chapter head to legitimize the rest. Between this and the Dzṽngdǎ core (8:3–7) is a middle stratum comprising 8:2a/b and 8:8–17, which is also self-consistent, though different from the Dzṽngdǎ core and the outer layer. The linking idea is emphasis on ritual (8:2a) and subordination of rṽn (8:2b, 8:10). This suggests that the Dzṽngdǎ material (8:3–7 less 8:4) is the original chapter, which we may call 8A, that 8:2a/b and 8:8–17 are a first addendum, which we may call 8B, and that 8:1 and 8:18–21 are a second addendum, which we may call 8C. The late date of 8C is supported by the fact that *no earlier figure than Jōu-gūng*, the first ruler of Lǔ, is mentioned in the Analects through LY 7. The motive for 8C, besides filling out the chapter to standard length, may have been to create a Confucian pedigree for these mythical figures.²⁹

The contempt of 8:4 for the “ordering of ritual vessels” contradicts the ritual emphasis in 8B, and is thus later than 8B, but it also lacks the 8C antiquarianism, and since 8C seems to have completed the 24-passage form, it must predate 8C, as a single-passage interpolation added sometime between the two layer additions.

Language. The Dzṽngdǎ sayings include the sacral pronoun yṽ 予 replacing wú 吾 as the first-person pronoun. This usage links the 8A core with LY 7, where the same usage first occurs, not contradicting the natural inference that LY 7 was compiled by Dzṽngdǎ during his lifetime, as head of the Lǔ Confucian school.

Date. The 8A core may be a memorial compilation for Dzṽngdǎ (its 4 *sayings* paralleling the 4 *sections* of the Confucius memorial, LY 4). It may in any case plausibly be dated to the year of his death, traditionally **0436**.

Compiler. Dzṽngdǎ’s elder son **Dzṽng Ywáen** 曾元 was presumably his chief mourner, and is thus also the likeliest compiler of the 8A memorial sayings.

²⁹Kimura **Kōshi** 322–329 agrees that the concentric 8:1, 8:18–21 is the latest layer. He sees 8:2b as Dzṽngdǎ’s comment on Confucius’s 2a, and 8:1 and 8:2a/b as duplicated in several strata – (a) 8:1, 8:18–21, (b) 8:1–2, (c) 8:2–7, (d) 8:2, 8:8–17 – handed down in *both* the schools of Confucius and of Dzṽngdǎ before being combined in the later school of Dzṽngdǎ. Eno **Sources** proposes a complex variant of the Kimura hypothesis. We feel that a one-school accretion hypothesis adequately explains the Analects material, but note the need for further study of the Dzṽngdǎ school both in and before Hàn.

8A 8B ? 8C

[Antiquity Addendum, 8C]

┌ 1 virtuous Tà-bwó

[Ritual Addendum, 8B]

2a Ritual **limits** on behavior

┌ 2b Gentleman as **models**

[Dz̄vngdž Memorial, 8A] [Dz̄vngdž Aggrandizement]

3 Dz̄vngdž **dies**

< 4 Dz̄vngdž dies; M̀vng head visits

5 Dz̄vngdž's **deceased** friend Yén Hwéi

6 Dz̄vngdž on competence of the **gentleman**

7 Dz̄vngdž on moral duty of the **gentleman**

┌ 8 Three-stage curriculum for **gentlemen**

9 Culture cannot be understood by **commoners**

10 Hardships make most people **lawless**

11 Arrogance in a gentleman is a **defect**

12 Most three-year students aspire to **office**

13 Advice to future **officials**

14 Prohibition against **outsiders** discussing policy

15 Appreciation of **court** musician J̄r's performance

16 **Disapproval** of the insincere and dishonest

17 **Anxiety** about even sincere learners

┌ 18 **Virtue** of Shùn and Yǔ

19 **Virtue** of Yáu

20a Shùn's five **ministers**

20b Wǔ's ten **ministers**

20c Comment on Tāng and Yǔ

21 Comment on Yǔ

LY 8 Conspectus

(Including later concentric additions 8B and 8C and single interpolation 8:4)

LY 9

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 9 contains 30 passages, of which 9:30 has a second, internal “The Master said” formula, and may be divided as 9:30a/b. This division gives a total of **31 passages**.

Interpolations. As in LY 7, several passages (9:1, 4, and 10) are descriptions rather than quotations. The first of these precedes a pair of sayings, and thus is also formally extraneous. Other suspect passages interrupt pairs (9:9, 26) or fail to pair with an envoi (9:14, 30b); these four passages, making seven in all, should be considered interpolations. Removing them leaves **24 passages** in the chapter.

Language and Form. Thematic divisions are formally signaled by unpaired envois at 9:5 (the end of a section of three sayings on culture) and 9:30a (the chapter end). Study of content suggests another thematic break at 9:16, ending a series depicting Confucius’s life, and preceding one on the pursuit of virtue. A final section, 9:28–30a, is concerned with rivalries and intrigues in office, and how to judge colleagues.³⁰ Several LY 9 passages have counterparts in LY 7 or LY 8, most dramatically the Confucius death scene in 9:12 (relating to 7:35).³¹ The thematic division at 9:16/17 is paralleled by an indebtedness pattern: 9:16 is the last passage with an LY 7 counterpart, while 9:17 is the first passage based on LY 8. The resulting sectional pattern, 3-8-10-3, contains a formal innovation:

LY 4	7- 3	3- 3	16 passages
LY 5	3- 9	9- 3	24 passages
LY 6	3-11	3- 7	24 passages
LY 7	5- 7	9- 3	24 passages
LY 8	2- 2		4 passages
LY 9	3- 8	10- 3	24 passages

it is the first *full-length* chapter in which some sections have an even number of passages, and thus do not conclude with the finishing device of an unpaired envoi.

Date. The statement in 9:15 that a reform of Lǚ court music occurred after “Confucius’s” return from Wèi contrasts with 7:14, in which “Confucius” finds that Chǐ court music surpassed his previous experience. A Lǚ political shift from Chǐ to Wèi may be implied. If the Chǐ attacks on Lǚ territory in 0412, 0411, and 0408 motivated Lǚ to make a new alliance with Wèi, then negotiations might have occurred in 0407/0406, and the new cultural alignment might have had time to be reflected in the elite culture of Lǚ, and thus mirrored in LY 9, by **c0405**.

Compiler. The close relation of LY 9 to LY 7–8, respectively the chapter and some individual sayings of Dzǔngdǔ, has a parallel in the fact that the use of the pronoun yǔ 予 in solemn contexts also occurs in LY 9. **Dzǔng Ywǎn** 曾元, the most likely scribe for LY 8, is by the same token the most likely inheritor of Dzǔngdǔ’s role as school head. LY 9 would then reflect his tenure, which would cover the years from 0436 (Dzǔngdǔ’s death) to slightly after c0405.

³⁰Kimura **Kōshi** 329f divides the chapter into three sections by content: manners (9:1–15), love of learning (9:16–23, with 9:16 distinctive), and teaching (9:24–30). We use formal factors in reaching our slightly different segmentation of the material.

³¹Kimura **Kōshi** 339f notes this same similarity, and suggests that LY 9 “may have used material left over by the LY 7 compiler.”

[A. On Culture]

- 2 Culture is **more than** mastery of specific skills
- 3 Culture is **not mere** retention of older usages
- 5 Confucius has a divine mandate to preserve Jōu culture (< 7:5, 7:23)

[B. Confucius's Life and Teaching]

- 6 Confucius stresses his **humble beginnings** (< 7:19, 7:34)
- 7 Variant of preceding: **humble circumstances**
- 8 **Among beginners**, Confucius will talk with anybody (< 7:7, 7:29)
- 11 **As an adept**, Yén Hwéi despairs of exhausting Confucius's example
- 12 Confucius renounces **sham** retinue at death (< 7:35)
- 13 Confucius awaits **proper** office during life
- 15 Confucius reforms **court poetry** after return from Wèi (< 7:14)
- 16 Confucius satisfied with **court and family** duties (< 7:2)

[C. The Pursuit of Virtue]

- 17 Stream as **model of unremitting progress** (< 8:3)
- 18 Sexual desire as **paradigm of intense concentration** (< 8:3)
- 19 Confucius will help any who **make an effort** on their own
- 20 Yén Hwéi as an example of **assiduousness** in lessons (< 8:5)
- 21 Confucius **laments** Yén Hwéi's death (< 8:5)
- 22 Confucius **alludes to** Yén Hwéi's death (< 8:5)
- 23 Men deserve no respect **if they fail to realize early promise**
- 24 Maxims are fine only **if they succeed in inspiring better conduct**
- 25 **Don't be afraid** to change if you are wrong
- 27 **Don't be ashamed** of being poorly dressed

[D. Intrigues in Office]

- 28 Pine as an emblem of **fidelity in hard times** (< 8:6)
- 29 One with true virtue can **withstand adversities and dangers** (< 8:6)
- 30a Distinction among low-level and high-level colleagues

LY 9 Conspectus

(Showing affinities with LY 7 and LY 8)

LY 10

Chapter Inventory. The material of LY 10, unlike that of every other Analects chapter, consists of descriptions of behavior rather than of quotations from Confucius. Editors differ widely in the way they divide it into passages. The Hú Yèn commentary as preserved with the notes of Hwáng Kǎn (488–545), a copy of which was recovered in Japan, specifies that the entire chapter is to be regarded as a single section. Later editors note this “old” tradition, but subdivide the material in various ways: Jū Syī (1130–1200) into 17 passages, Lyóu Bǎu-nán (1791–1855) into 15, Legge (1861) into 18, the 1929 concordance into 21, Waley (1938) into 18, and Lau (1979) into 27. Its thematic consistency makes it a virtual treatise, as the “old” tradition recognizes; on the other hand, with the formal precedent of LY 4–9 in mind, the compilers of LY 10 may well have construed their treatise as falling into paragraphs, as later commentators implicitly suggest. We find the following subdivisions of the 21 concordance sections to be both convenient and meaningful: 1a/b, 5a/b/c, 6a/b/c/d/e, 7a/b, 12a/b, and 16a/b. These divisions give 31 passages. Recombining 10:6e/7a into one (both deal with behavior during meals) yields a final chapter total of **30 passages**.

Interpolations. Waley³² has pointed out that the main material was originally descriptive of the “gentleman” (jyŵndž 君子), preserved as the subject of 10:5a, and that the substitution of the grammatical subject Kǔngdž 孔子 “Confucius” is an overlay. The situation is thus the reverse of that in LY 7 or LY 9, where the descriptive passages were exceptional; here, description is the norm, and passages which report conversations of Confucius or mention his disciples or other figures (10:10 Jì Kāngdž, 10:11 and 10:15 implicitly Confucius, 10:21 Dž-lù) should be excised as later Confucianizations. With 10:21 goes 10:20, a possibly related and in any case cryptic fragment. 10:9 is out of place thematically, and presumably later. Eliminating these interpolations reduces the chapter total from 30 to **24 passages**.

Form and Language. This presumptively original material can be seen as grouped under four distinct headings: Court etiquette (10:1a–4), rules concerning clothing and food (10:5a–6e/7a), visits and gifts (10:7b–14), and private behavior (10:16a–19). Pairing is detectable as a principle of arrangement (see the conspectus at right). The layout (5-8-6-5) recalls that of LY 9, in which also the first and last sections are of the same size, and both middle sections (of which the first is one pair longer than the second) lack an envoi passage. There is a thematic progression from courtly to private protocol. Linguistically, the chapter is rich in reduplicative expressions (affectives) used, as in the Shī, to describe manner or attitude.

Date and Compiler. The SJ 47 list of Kǔng descendants ends with datable Hàn figures. Counting back from these at 25 years per succession-generation, they reach to c0400, implying a period of Kǔng leadership following the disciple phase which began with the death of Confucius and ended with Dzŵngdž’s son Dzŵng Ywǎn in c0400. SJ 47 then gives us the names of the Kǔng heads of the school, from c0400 to the end of Lǔ in 0249. The first of them, **Dž-sz** 子思, would occupy the first quarter of the 04c,³³ and LY 10, which as a unique production is probably his only chapter, may plausibly be dated to the end of that span, **c0380**.

³²Waley *Analects* 146n1 and 147n3.

³³For a more detailed conjecture on the Kǔng lineage, see Appendix 4.

[A. Public Occasions]

- 1a Speaks hesitantly in the village but readily at court (**slow/fast**)
- 1b At court, is casual with lower officers, circumspect with ruler (**fast/slow**)
- 2 Etiquette for receiving a court guest (**another**)
- 3 Etiquette for entering as a court guest (**oneself**)
- 4 Etiquette for acting as a symbolic presenter

[B. Clothing and Food]

- 5a **Formal** wear
- 5b **Informal** wear
- 5c Sacrificial **dress**
- 6a Sacrificial **food**
- 6b Prohibitions **against** certain tainted food
- 6c Limits **allowed** on meat, wine, and spices
- 6d **Handling** and eating of sacrificial-offering food gifts
- 6e/7a **Posture** while eating sacrificial-offering food

[C. Visits and Gifts]

- 7b Does not remain at local banquet after elders leave (**going**)
- 8 Is only an observer at local ritual celebrations (**staying**)
- 12a Etiquette for receiving gifts of food from ruler (**receiving favor**)
- 12b Etiquette of attending prince at meals (**returning favor**)
- 13 Receiving visit from prince while ill (**receiving**)
- 14 Responding to summons from prince (**returning**)

[D. Private Behavior]

- 16a Funeral of impoverished friend (**giving**)
- 16b Receiving presents from friend (**receiving**)
- 17 Posture during sleep (**avoiding death**)
- 18 Respect to those in mourning (**accepting death**)
- 19 Mounting and driving chariot

LY 11

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 11 contains 24 passages, of which three (11:13, 18, and 19) either have, or as Waley points out in the case of 11:13, clearly imply, a second “The Master said” incipit. Each should be divided (into 11:13a/b, 18a/b, and 19a/b), giving a total of **27 passages**.

Interpolations. Three of these are structurally anomalous. 11:12 is on the afterlife, perhaps prompted by the funeral topic of 11:8–11, but itself a general statement alien to the chapter ethos, which is wholly concerned with judgements of disciples.³⁴ It is thus implausible as an envoi to 11:8–11. 11:20 and 21 do not pair with each other, but are followed by the pair 11:22/23; they thus compete for the role of envoi to 11:19a/b. The aspirational 11:21 is akin to the aspirational 11:19a/b, whereas the longer 11:20 is about adjusting advice to the individual, and hence, however interesting, thematically irrelevant and presumably late. Finally, the long and beautiful 11:24 follows the pair 11:22/23, and structurally can only be an envoi to them, but its theme (that a elegant seclusion is preferable to office) is opposed to the service ethos of the chapter, and its literary devices (descriptions of feelings, descriptions of nature, sheer length) are unprecedented in the Analects up to this point. These three, 11:12, 20, and 24, may thus be construed as interpolations. Eliminating them leaves the chapter with a total of **24 passages**.

Form. The pairing pattern shows two envois, 11:3 (defining 11:1–3 as a first section, which is thematically devoted to evaluations of *groups* of disciples) and 11:21 (marking the end of a self-cultivation group that includes only 11:19a/b; a final thematic section on self-cultivation has appeared in many earlier chapters). The four highly emotional sayings on Yén Hwéi’s death (11:8–11) follow four sayings in praise of disciples including Yén Hwéi (11:4–7), and seem to be a series of positive evaluations, whereas 11:13a–18b alternate praise and denunciation, and focus especially on Dž-lù. These would then constitute the two inner sections.

The final pair, 11:22/23, are a novelty: not a single-saying *section* envoi (like 11:21, preceding), but a paired-section *chapter* envoi. Such concluding doublets become a standard structural feature in almost all subsequent chapters. This one resumes the hostility to Dž-lù which was thematic in 11C, and so is not a true chapter summary, but more precisely a retrospective highlight.

Date and Authorship. The chief feature of LY 11, besides its focus on disciple evaluations, is its strident tone, which shifts from what 11:10 admits is exaggerated mourning for Yén Hwéi to criticism of Dž-lù, a note formally emphasized by the new chapter envoi. This contrasts with the neutral prescriptive tone of LY 10, and must represent a different author, presumably one within the Kǔng family (veneration of Yén Hwéi, a kinsman of Confucius, and opposition to other disciples, would be intelligible for Kǔng family members). The only available candidate is the next name of the SJ 47 list, **Dž-shàng** 子 上. As to date, in the absence of internal evidence we may provisionally conjecture **c0360**, halfway between the conjectural c0380 of LY 10, preceding, and the more closely datable 0342 of LY 3, following.

³⁴Lau **Analects** 270, astonishingly, says that LY 11 is “entirely devoted to Confucius.” Soothill’s title for LY 11 is “Chiefly Concerning the Disciples.” Waley **Analects** 142n4 further construes LY 11:19, which does not mention disciples by name, as a remark on Confucius’s attitude toward those “in different stages of progress.”

[A. The Disciple Pantheon]

- 1 Confucius **prefers** his earlier disciples
- 2 Confucius **misses** his Ch'vn and Tsai disciples
- 3 Pantheon of ten distinguished disciples

[B. Praise of Disciples: Yén Hwéi]

- 4 Yén Hwéi “no help,” **he accepted all Confucius’s sayings**
- 5 M'ın Dž-chyēn a good son, **his actions confirm his relatives’ praise**
- 6 Nán Rúng assiduous in **repeating an exemplary poem stanza**
- 7 Yén Hwéi had an unmatched **dedication to learning**
- 8 Confucius **refuses his chariot** for Yén Hwéi’s burial
- 9 Confucius **mourns for Hwéi’s death** as ending his Heavenly mission
- 10 Confucius resists suggestion that he is **mourning excessively** for Hwéi
- 11 Confucius criticizes disciples for giving Hwéi **too grand** a funeral

[C. Praise and Blame of Disciples: Dž-lú]

- 13a Confucius pleased with dutiful attitudes of **M'ın Dž-chyēn** and others
- 13b Confucius implicitly displeased with **Dž-lù’s** rashness
- 14 Confucius pleased with conservative remark of **M'ın Dž-chyēn**
- 15 Confucius criticizes conduct of **Dž-lù**
- 16 Confucius **balances shortcomings** of Dž-jāng and Dž-syà
- 17 Confucius **denounces** extortionate conduct of Rǎn Chyóu
- 18a Confucius distributes **criticism** of four disciples
- 18b Confucius balances **praise** of Yén Hwéi and (sardonically) Dž-gùng

[D. Self-Cultivation]

- 19a Must follow proper path to **reach esoteric goal**
- 19b Cannot tell if outward finesse **implies a true gentleman**
- 21 Yén Hwéi “cannot die” while there is a chance to learn from Confucius

[E. Envoi: Final Denunciations]

- 22 Confucius **belittles** official capacity of Dž-lù and Rǎn Chyóu
- 23 Confucius **resents** Dž-lù’s glib defense of his conduct

LY 3

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 3 contains **26 passages**, none of them seeming to require subdivision.

Interpolations. As will be seen, the chapter was apparently distorted in the final stages of compilation, and its pairing pattern is thus not a simple guide to the detection of interpolations. We may rely instead, initially, on the evident fact that virtually the whole chapter is on the subject of ritual.³⁵ The two sayings 3:5 and 3:24 deal more directly with the subject of political forms and proprieties, and are thus suspect as interpolations. We may then notice that 3:4, a contrast between Chinese and non-Chinese political forms, interrupts two closely parallel sayings, 3:4/6, both of which mention Lín Fàng,³⁶ and that 3:24, a prediction of better political times to come, similarly interrupts two closely parallel sayings, 3:23/25, both dealing with court music. Eliminating 3:5 and 3:24 leaves **24 passages**.

Form. Most of the chapter sayings are about the theory and practice of public ritual; several are however exercised about the usurpation of higher-level ritual forms. This note is sounded in the opening 3:1–3, where the usurpation is of the royal dance and poetic repertoire, and is also seen in the sarcastic 3:6 mention of Lín Fàng (compare the harmless question of Lín Fàng himself, in 3:4), 3:10 on the dī sacrifice (compare the simple exposition of the dī sacrifice, in 3:11), and the angry dismissal of the knowledge of Gwǎn Jùng in 3:22, who knows everything about ritual except that he is not entitled to practice certain parts of it. The final cry of pain in 3:26 concludes this subset of sayings. It is manifest that the compilers of LY 3 are reacting against some ritual abuse in Lǚ (symbolized by the Jì clan, 3:1–2 or in Chí (symbolized by Gwǎn Jùng, 3:22). These protest passages, though they technically complete the 24-saying chapter form, at some places produce skewed parallel structures (notably the dī sacrifice pieces, 3:10 and 11), and hence do not fulfill, but violate, a chapter structure presumably partly complete at the time they were added. LY 3 then seems to have begun in retrospective calm, and ended in contemporary rage. For the flawed structure, including three protest passages which form a sort of extra prologue at the head of the chapter, see the conspectus at right.

Date. The ritual outrage which is by far the likeliest target of the protest passages is the Chí usurpation of the royal title King (wáng 王) in 0342, some years before the same title was adopted by the ruler of Ngwèi (in 0335). These passages, and thus the completion of the chapter as a whole, would then date from **0342**.

Compiler. This dating puts us in the probable headship of the third figure on the SJ 47 Kǔng descendant list, **Dǔ-jyā** 子家. Nothing is known of him from SJ 47 except that he died at the relatively early age of 45.

³⁵Lau *Analects* 269 claims that this general trait is “without any exception,” but this holds for the chapter as it stands only if one views all government and social functions as aspects of ritual. Compare n35, following. LY 3, like all Kǔng family chapters so far, does nevertheless remain strongly monothematic.

³⁶Lau *Analects* ap 3:6 himself refers to 3:4, as does virtually every commentator of any standing since the semi-anonymous Hàn scholar Bāu 包 (see Lyóu *Jǐng-yì* ap 3:6). This may well count as one of the great missed opportunities in *Analects* scholarship. The Lín Fàng pair, though ultimately complex, is still probably the easiest place to begin to observe the separation of closely related sayings by the intrusion of later material.

[Prologue: The Usurpation of Ritual]

- 1 Confucius **cannot bear** usurpatious Jì rituals
- 2 Confucius **sardonic about Jì** use of Shī ceremonial poem
- 3 One who is not rǎn has nothing to do with ritual or music

[A. Basic Principles of Ritual]

- 4 **Lín Fàng** asks about guidelines for ritual
- 6 Jì know no more about the mountain sacrifice than **Lín Fàng**
- 7 **Courtesy underlies** seeming competition in archery (cf 16)
- 8 **Ritual maxim hidden** in seeming description in Shī poem

[B. Explanations of Ritual Traditions]

- 9 Evolution of ritual allows prediction of future rituals (cf 14)
- 10 Confucius cannot bear to watch the usurped **dì sacrifice**
- 11 Confucius **explains dì** sacrifice implies political domination
- 12 Confucius **rejects gloss on jì** “offering” as dzài “be present”
- 13 Confucius **disapproves** folk maxim valuing food over sacrifices
- 14 Confucius **exults** in the richness of the Jōu heritage (cf 9)

[C. Adjustments to Ritual]

- 15 Confucius asks **politely** about each step of Grand Shrine service
- 16 Old way was **not to count** piercing the hide in archery (cf 7)
- 17 Dž-gùng wants to abolish **old ways**; Confucius prefers them
- 18 Serving ruler by **older protocol** would now seem sycophantic
- 19 Confucius analyzes ritual as framework for **minister/ruler relation**
- 20 Confucius expounds Shī poem as ideal of **husband/wife relation**

[D. Praise and Blame of Ancient Rituals]

- 21 Dzǎi Wǒ rebuked for **criticizing** Jōu grave customs to Aī-gūng
- 22 Confucius **belittles** the ritual expertise of Gwǎn Jùng
- 23 Talk with Lǚ music master about **orchestral** performance practice
- 25 Pacific Shàu **dance** beautiful; martial Wǔ **dance** not completely so
- 26 Confucius cannot bear insincerity in sacrifice

LY 3 Conspectus

(The passages comprising the final protest layer are indented)

LY 12

Chapter Inventory and Interpolations. The concordance text of LY 12 contains 24 passages, of which 12:12 ends with a seeming editorial comment. Dividing it as 12:12a/b gives **25 passages**. Leslie questions 12:5 as possibly interpolated,³⁷ but it fits the pattern of the chapter, which is on now-familiar lines. Retaining it, and eliminating only 12:12b, yields a final chapter total of **24 passages**.

Form. Lau notes that almost every saying in LY 12 is a question.³⁸ We may further observe that the chapter seems to be divided by the content of the question, or, in the first two sections, by the degree of indirectness in the answer. The first section in particular emphasizes that the questioners (including the once notably acute Yén Hwéi) do not fully understand the answer or grasp its consequences, thus centering the learning process wholly in the teacher. This may reflect a new contemporary formality in the relations between teacher and student (see GZ 59); it also suits the ritual emphasis of the Kūng heads as seen in LY 10–11 and LY 3.

The profile of the chapter, determined by pairing and confirmed by thematic grouping, is 5-4-7-6-2. The first four sections follow the LY 9–11 model in having sections with and without envois; however, it alternates these, rather than confining the sections without envois to the middle of the chapter. The LY 11 innovation of a chapter envoi, or concluding pair of sayings, is resumed (it had been dropped in LY 3, perhaps to make LY 3 resemble the earlier chapters, and thus seem plausible in its role as a proposed chapter). The last few chapter profiles are:

LY 9		3-8	10- 3	24 passages
LY 10		5-8	6- 5	24 passages
LY 11		3-8	8- 3 -2	24 passages including envoi
LY 3	[3]	4-6	6- 5	24 passages including prologue
LY 12		5-4	7- 6 -2	24 passages including envoi

A remarkable feature of the chapter is its frequent echoes of contemporary texts, implying an interschool dialogue which it seems not inappropriate to identify as a sign of the onset of the so-called Hundred Schools period. Some echoes of chapters of the Chí Legalist compilation Gwǎndž (GZ) which seem to be themselves early, or to reflect early ideas, are indicated in the conspectus, opposite. Apart from the GZ connection, LY 12 ventures into new ground in discussing the theory of the state and of rulership; topics which were never mentioned by Confucius.

Date. The benevolent populism of LY 12 is close to that expressed in the interviews of Mencius (MC 1). To a lesser extent, this is also true of LY 13. Both presumably represent the Analects-school heritage of Mencius, and may be dated shortly before his public career in 0320. LY 12 might thus be assigned to **c0326**.

Compiler. This date would fall within the early years of the fourth SJ 47 figure, **Dž-jīng** 子京. Given the early deaths of several Kūngs, at least some must have succeeded to the headship as minors, before age 20. A transitional stewardship may have occurred on such occasions. If Dž-jīng was an early successor, and Mencius was still in the school as a senior student, Mencius himself may have been included on Dž-jīng's transition team, and thus had an opportunity to influence LY 12.

³⁷Leslie **Notes** 2–27, especially the suggestion in 5–6.

³⁸Lau **Analects** 270–271.

[A. Cryptic Answers]

- 1 Yén Hwéi asks about rǎn; **promises to practice** maxim
- 2 Rǎn Yūng asks about rǎn; **promises to practice** maxim (< GZ 3:5–6)
- 3 Sǐmǎ Nyóu asks about rǎn; **misses the point** of the answer
- 4 Sǐmǎ Nyóu asks about the jywǎndǒ; **misses the point** of the answer
- 5 Sǐmǎ Nyóu grieves about fate; is rebuked by Dǒ-syà (< GZ 2:10)

[B. Open Answers]

- 6 Dǒ-jāng asks about wisdom; gets **straight** answer
- 7 Dǒ-gūng asks about government; gets **consecutive** answer (< GZ 1:3)
- 8 Statesman belittles culture; is **rebuked** by Dǒ-gūng
- 9 Prince unsatisfied with taxes; is **rebuked** by Yóudǒ (< GZ 3:11, 7:10)

[C. The State and the People]

- 10 Dǒ-jāng asks about inconsistency; gets **poem**
- 11 Prince asks about government: gets **cryptic prose** (< GZ 2:45–46)
- 12a Confucius remarks that Dǒ-lù is **efficient in judging**
- 13 Confucius remarks that it is better to **have no trials** (< GZ 3:16)
- 14 Dǒ-jāng gets advice on **diligence** in public business (< GZ 2:42)
- 15 Confucius remarks about role of **ritual** in public business (> GZ 1:2)
- 16 Confucius contrasts gentleman and little man

[D. The Theory of Rule]

- 17 Jì Kāngdǒ gets **punning definition** of administration (< GZ 3:10)
- 18 Jì Kāngdǒ gets **inverse advice** about reducing crime (< GZ 3:10)
- 19 Jì Kāngdǒ gets distinction between **ruling and killing** (< GZ 1:3, 7:7)
- 20 Dǒ-jāng gets distinction between **fame and influence**
- 21 Confucius **uses poem** to answer Fán Chǐ question
- 22 Confucius **uses pun** to answer Fán Chǐ question (< GZ 3:9, 7:7)

[E. Envoi: Friendship]

- 23 Dǒ-gūng asks about **friends**
- 24 Dǒwǎngdǒ comments about **friends** in propagating rǎn

LY 12 Conspectus

(Influence from < and on > the Gwǎndǒ is noted in parentheses)

LY 13

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 13 contains 30 passages, of which 13:22 has a second “The Master said” incipit, and should be divided as 13:22a/b, giving a chapter total of **31 passages**.

Interpolations. Seven of these are in one way or another formally anomalous, and thus suspect as possible interpolations. 13:3 and 13:12 fall between pairs of sayings which seem to be on the same theme, and should be in the same section; 13:3 and 13:12 therefore do not suggest themselves as section envois. 13:7–8, not themselves an obvious pair (one is governmental, and the other ritualistic, in content), interrupt the plausible pair 13:6/9. And 13:21 and 13:22a/b both come between the plausible envoi saying 13:20 (which seems to relate to the preceding passages without pairing with the last of them) and the plausible pair 13:23/24, the latter of which seems to begin a new theme, and thus a probably marks a new thematic section. All of these are thus presumptively interpolations. Eliminating them leaves the chapter with a total of **24 passages**.

Form and Content. As thus clarified, the thematic tenor of the entire chapter is the theory of government; specifically, an opposition to what are recognizable as Legalist theories of government, some of which have counterparts in seemingly early chapters of the *Gwǎndž*. Within that general theme, there are four sections developing subtopics such as the nature of government and the character of the ruler and his ministers.³⁹ The formal ground plan is 6-5-5-6-2, a symmetrical chapter followed by the two-passage envoi which has been standard practice since LY 11. Like previous examples, the envoi is a thematic footnote to the chapter, rather than an epitome of it as a whole, or an echo of its beginning passage.

Within sections, there is, in addition to the basic AABB successive-pairing pattern, a seemingly intentional use of *alternating* pairing: ABAB (as in 13:16–19, which alternate general and specific rules of administration), and also of *palindromic* pairing: ABBA (as in 13:25–28), the latter echoing the palindromic layout of the main chapter (6-5-5-6), and bringing the main chapter to a formal close. This formal wit has precedents in earlier chapters, but it is new in LY 13 as compared to LY 12. The content, like that of LY 12, is close to the position of Mencius in MC 1, but perhaps less conspicuously so than LY 12 itself.

Date. For the reason cited under LY 12, LY 13 should precede the beginning of Mencius’s career in 0320, and by position it should also follow LY 12. The arbitrary date **c0322** is an initial hypothesis that satisfies both these conditions.

Compiler. The closeness of LY 13 to LY 12 in time suggests the same compiler, **Dž-jīng**. The differences in the style and to a lesser extent in the thematic emphasis of LY 13 imply either that his character is developing, or that it is being given fuller scope. If, as conjectured above, he was a minor as of the composition of LY 12, these differences might be explained by his having reached an age of independent discretion as of the composition of LY 13. This inference has affected the solution proposed in Appendix 4 (page 287) to the chronology of the Kǔng school heads.

³⁹Lau **Analects** 271 sees a main thematic break between 13:17 (ending a series on government) and 13:18 (beginning a series on the gentleman). We rely on the envoi function of 13:15 and 13:21 as section dividers in reaching our different conclusion.

[A. Ends and Means of Government]

- 1 Dž-lù asks about **government**
- 2 Rǎn Yūng asks about **government** (< GZ 3:15, 7:6, 7:19)
- 4 The **peasant skill of husbandry** is not needed by ministers
- 5 The **elegant accomplishment of the Poems** is worthless if not practical
- 6 The upright ruler's orders will be obeyed **without asking** (< GZ 7:10)
- 9 The ruler must **enrich and teach** the people (> GZ 1:3, 3:29, 7:7)

[B. The Role of Ministers]

- 10 If I had power, **in only 3 years** I could finish the job
- 11 It is true that **only after 100 years** could one abolish executions
- 13 **A private person** who governs himself can govern others (< GZ 3:19)
- 14 **A private person** is still concerned with government policy
- 15 The ruler must not govern for private purposes

[C. The Basis of Government]

- 16 **Test of government** is approval of its people (< GZ 1:1, 3:7)
- 17 **Technique of government** is delegation (< GZ 2:35)
- 18 Family loyalties **vary** in different places
- 19 The principle of loyalty is **universal** in all places
- 20 On official scrupulousness and adroitness

[D. The Official in the New Society]

- 23 Little man and gentleman **have opposite character**
- 24 Good man and bad man **have opposite opinions**
- 25 Gentleman is **easy to work for**; little man is easy to please
- 26 Gentleman is **dignified**; little man is arrogant
- 27 Steadiness and solidity are **near to rǎn**
- 28 Precision and scruple are **the attributes of** the officer

[E. Envoi: Preparation for War]

- 29 The people **are ready** for war after seven years' indoctrination
- 30 To lead **an untrained** people into war is to cast them away

LY 13 Conspectus

(Influence from < and on > the Gwǎndž is noted in parentheses)

LY 2

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 2 contains **24 passages**, none of them seeming to require subdivision.

Interpolations. The 24 passages of the concordance text exactly meet the now familiar expectation for the standard Analects chapter, and none of them seems to interrupt, or be otherwise misplaced in, the also familiar pattern of four thematic sections (plus chapter envoi), each composed of paired sayings with or without a final envoi saying. It would thus seem that there are no interpolations, and that the original chapter contained these same **24 passages**. This agrees with, but is even more pronounced than, the small number of interpolations found in the also preposed chapter LY 3, which had only two. It would seem that text-initial position gave a prominence which not only exerted a powerful influence on perceptions of the rest of the work, but conferred a visibility which to some extent protected it from interpolations. There has so far been no clear indication in the text itself that the Analects was memorized by students in the Lǚ school (LY 13:5 suggests that at least portions of the Shīr corpus were being memorized by those in office), and even if it were, it is a familiar truth that the beginning of a text is the part that sits firmest in memory. Compare the discussions of LY 14–15 and LY 1, following.

Form and Content. Like the preceding LY 12–13, LY 2 considers questions of government, but unlike them it is not solely on that theme.⁴⁰ It also discusses, and devotes its second section to, the domestic virtue of filiality, relating it to earlier values by the unifying principle of ritual propriety (12:5). There is no sense that filiality replaces public virtues; rather, the chapter invites the inference that it completes the personal virtues of the gentleman. This inclusion also resolves a conflict between family and state loyalty that was raised by 13:18 (Upright Gǔng). It will be further worked into the system in the later LY 1.

Formally, LY 2 uses the ABAB pairing variants which were also noted in LY 13. It departs from earlier precedent in having no section-final envoi passages; unlike every previous chapter, all its sections contain an even number of sayings. The profiles of the last few chapters are:

LY 12	5-4	7-6	-2	24 passages
LY 13	6-5	5-6	-2	24 passages
LY 2	4-4	10-4	-2	24 passages

Date. LY 2 is in part compatible with, but in part moves beyond, LY 12–13; it is notably less Mencian than LY 12–13. This implies a time after, but probably not *long* after, the departure of Mencius in or shortly prior to 0320. Its initial section strikes the new cosmological note, with the ruler seen as the still point at the center of the turning universe. This flattery, and the summative nature of the chapter, would be appropriate for a presentation to Lǚ Píng-gǔng, and a highly suitable time for such a presentation would be the year of his accession, **0317**.

Compiler. That year would put the chapter still within the probable lifetime of **Dǔ-jīng**, whose independent ideological and stylistic tendencies, free of any immediate Mencian presence, it may thus represent.

⁴⁰Lau **Analects** 269 however seems to go too far in saying that the chapter “lacks any obvious principle of organization.”

[A. Virtuous Government]

- 1 Governing by virtue is a **fixed star** for the people (~ GZ 3:29–35)
- 2 The culture of the 300 Shī is **without a flaw** (> GZ 3:29)
- 3 Governing by virtue will **produce order** among the people (> GZ 3:35)
- 4 Confucius describes process of **perfecting virtue**

[B. Filiality]

- 5 M̀ng Yìdž asks about filiality: is told about ritual as **outer** guideline
- 6 M̀ng Wū-bwó asks about filiality; is told to be **assiduous**
- 7 Dž-yóu asks about filiality; is reminded of **inner** emotional basis
- 8 Dž-syà asks about filiality; is told that **more than deeds** is required

[C. Higher and Lower Consistencies]

- 9 Yén Hwéi seems stupid but **on inquiry** is not stupid
- 10 Men's nature is revealed by **observation** of their behavior (< GZ 3:17)
- 11 A teacher must adapt, not **merely repeat the old**
- 12 A gentleman must use judgement, not be **merely a tool**
- 13 A gentleman considers things from **the other person's viewpoint**
- 14 A gentleman sees things from **a wide perspective**
- 15 Meditative insights **are risky** unless moderated by study
- 16 Analogous values **are harmful** if not derived from the same postulates
- 17 Know **when you do not know** something
- 18 Be **skeptical** of what you hear, cautious in what you say

[D. Influencing the People]

- 19 Promote the honest **to get popular support** (~ GZ 3:37–38)
- 20 Display filiality **to get the loyalty of the people** (~ GZ 3:37–38)
- 21 Confucius's life **is a contribution** to government
- 22 An untrustworthy man **is absolutely useless**

[E. Envoi: Guidelines for the Future]

- 23 **Change**: nature of the eventual successor of Jōu (> GZ 2:62)
- 24 **Permanency**: refrain from the improper and do the needful

LY 2 Conspectus

*(Influence from <, on >, and with ~ the Gwǎndž is noted in parentheses)
(ABAB pairs are indented)*

LY 14

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 14 contains 44 passages, of which four suggest subdivision due to their internal parallel structure. These are 14:1 (two parallel comments), 14:12 (very similar), 14:26 (two similar sayings credited to different speakers), and 14:37 (a second “The Master said” incipit). All but 14:12 are also divided in the traditional text used by Legge. Separating them as 14:1a/b, 14:12a/b, 14:27a/b, and 14:37a/b brings the chapter total to **48 passages**.

Form and Interpolations. LY 14 and 15, exceptionally, are twice the size of the average 24-passage Analects chapter. Either they have been composed from the beginning as a double of the usual form, which the thematic structure does not suggest,⁴¹ or they are massively interpolated. If the latter, then the interpolations are intended for these chapters in particular, and are not random later intrusions. In that case, it seems likely that the interpolations come from shortly after the chapters themselves, and constitute extensions rather than interpolations in the usual sense. This makes errors in identifying interpolations less costly, since the time differential may be small, but it also makes such errors more likely, due to the difficulty of discovering the original structure, overlaid as it seems to be by intrusions.

On the precedent established by the preceding chapters, LY 14 might be expected to have an overall thematic direction, to be divided into four thematic sections with a final envoi, and to consist of **24 passages**. As to the overall theme, impressions vary: Lau finds it to be “how to be a man,”⁴² Soothill sees the chapter as governmental.⁴³ Our own impression favors the latter view. Our conclusions as to the chapter structure are set forth in the conspectus at right; the argument for identifying the interpolations is implicit in this positive structure.

Date. LY 14 opens by criticizing the propriety of accepting salary whether or not a government is behaving in an orderly fashion (“possesses the Way,” 14:1a), noting that an officer must be geographically portable (14:2), wary in bad times (14:3), support agriculture over military policy (14:5), and tirelessly admonish the ruler (14:7); it ends by applying a populist test to governments, and noting that the ruler’s love of *lǐ* (“propriety, due process”) is vital to meeting that test. This situation will reach an apparent crisis in 15:1–2. Unfortunately, we know little of Lǔ court politics except from the Analects itself. The political theory of LY 14 agrees with that implied by LY 12–13 (c0326–0322), and may be a further development of it. The emphasis on the niceties of departure may reflect the controversy (MC, *passim*) over Mencius’s departure from Chǐ after the Yēn debacle of 0314 (itself reliably attested by the BA). LY 14 also seems to follow the Dzwǒ Jwàn, which from internal evidence was compiled in c0312. All this suggests an LY 14 date of **c0310**.

Compiler. Such a date would make LY 14 available as a source for the court politics of Píng-gūng’s later reign, and suggest the continued headship of **Dǔ-jīng**.

⁴¹Waley **Analects** 21 finds that parts of LY 14 “are not Confucian in their origin;” Lau **Analects** 271 notes that the chapter is “at first sight somewhat mixed in content.”

⁴²Lau **Analects** 271. In terms of the later scholastic view of the text, which sees it as emphasizing individual self-realization, every Analects chapter could be so characterized (for an analysis of LY 1–4 from this point of view, see Appendix 5).

⁴³Soothill **Analects** supplies for LY 14 the title “Chiefly Concerning Government and Certain Rulers.”

[A. The Officer and the State]

- 1a It is shameful to **accept** pay equally from **good and bad** governments
- 2 Service is the true **duty** of an officer
- 3 The proper conduct of the officer in **good and bad** times
- 5 Agriculture is the right **basis** for the country
- 7 Officers must **faithfully admonish** superiors
- 8 Scribes must **skillfully transmit** communications

[B. Historical Models for the Officer]

- 9 Gwǎn Jùng able to act without incurring **resentment**
- 11 It is difficult not to **resent** poverty
- 12a Past figures combine to define the **historical ideal**
- 12b On a more practical **present-day standard**
- 13 Confucius **questions** the description of an ideal figure
- 14 Confucius **doubts** the reputed lack of pressure in a dispossession
- 15 Contrasted achievements and shortcomings of two historical figures

[C. Larger Historical Principles]

- 16 Gwǎn Jùng is **criticized** for his misuse of ritual knowledge
- 17 Gwǎn Jùng is **vindicated** as contributing more than ordinary men
- 18 Gūngshú Wýndž is praised for **advancing a subordinate**
- 19 Wèi Líng-gūng was sustained by **able subordinates**

[D. The Confucians in Office]

- 21 Duty of an officer to **openly denounce** an outside atrocity
- 22 Duty of an officer to **openly oppose** his own ruler
- 32 Confucius was flexibly willing to **leave Lǚ**
- 36 Intrigues of enemies against Confucius **within Lǚ**
- 40 Procedure of officials during dynastic transition

[E. Envoi: The Welfare of the People]

- 41 If the ruler loves propriety, the people can be **used**
- 42 A minister who **benefits** the people is better than Yáu or Shùn

LY 15

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 15 contains **42 passages**, none of which immediately invites subdivision.

Form and Interpolations. The situation of LY 14 recurs in LY 15; the chapter has apparently been overlaid with an almost equal number of interpolations, in which circumstances the distinguishing of the original chapter format, and thus the objective identification of interpolations, is exceptionally difficult. On the model of LY 14, we assume that there is some version of the usual **24-passage** chapter pattern, probably in four thematic sections with a two-passage envoi, and that we have to identify a total of 18 passages which do not fit such a pattern as convincingly as those which are conjectured to constitute it.

The overall theme continues, as in LY 14 and for that matter in all chapters from LY 12 onward, to be governmental, and the strained court situation implied in LY 14 would appear, from the break implied or envisioned in 15:1, to have reached the point of crisis; the final saying in the unsorted material, 15:42, seems to complain that giving guidance under current conditions is like leading a blind man. Against this general background, there seem to emerge recognizable thematic sections on the risks (section B) and responsibilities (section C) of the honest courtier, and his specific tasks in troubled times (section D). ABAB pairing, noted on the LY 14 conspectus, seems to occur here in the two middle sections, giving palindromic symmetry to the design, which appears to be reflected also in the sizes of the sections, the profile (apart from the envoi) being apparently 3-8-8-3. This internal consistency of design is matched by the external continuity of elements of that design with earlier chapters, especially LY 13:

LY 12	5-4	7-6	-2	24 passages
LY 13	6-5	5-6	-2	24 passages
LY 2	6-4	10-4	-2	24 passages
LY 14	6-7	4-5	-2	24 passages
LY 15	3-8	8-3	-2	24 passages

Due to the number of interpolations, the arguments in individual cases must be the implicit ones contained in the statement of the pattern which the chapter makes when they are removed, as shown schematically in the conspectus, opposite. As noted under LY 14, and as developed in the detailed commentary to the passages appended in the main translation of LY 15, the time lag for most of these interpolations seems relatively small, which at least reduces the import of the almost inevitable errors in distinguishing original from added material.

Date. As an apparent later stage in the tense political situation implied by LY 14 (note the amplification, in 15:1, of the motif of principled political departure that was introduced in 14:32), we may plausibly assign LY 15 a hypothetical date shortly afterward, but still within the same reign, perhaps **c0305**. The evidently urgent situation itself is the best explanation of the remarkable number of what seem most likely to be afterthought self-interpolations in these two chapters.

Compiler. The closeness in apparent time again favors the inference that the chapter was produced under the continuing headship of **Dž-jīng**. If so, then the sectional profiles given above are a record of his formal choices as a compiler of Analects chapters (that in LY 12 is perhaps compromised by its origin under a transition arrangement). On present inferences, his is the largest contribution to the Analects, and this portion of the text might thus repay authorial analysis.

[A. Critique of Rulers]

- 1 Confucius in Wèi **criticizes** war-oriented policy
 2 Confucius in Ch'ín **maintains balance** despite hardship
 5 The ideal inactive ruler will leave policy to ministers

[B. The Gentleman and His Superiors]

- 6 Maxim for **morally advancing oneself**
 7 **Surviving** in changed circumstances
 8 Waste neither words nor the chance of **convincing others**
 9 **Danger to life** may result from following r'yn
 12 The minister **must plan for what is far off**
 15 The minister must **keep resentment at a distance**
 16 Students who **lack a sense of urgency** are hopeless
 17 Colleagues who **never speak of the right** are difficult

[C. The Gentleman in Power]

- 25 Ruler's virtue is **revealed** by the condition of the people
 26 **Scribal honesty** requires leaving uncertain passages blank
 27 Gentleman's virtue is **obstructed** by concern for small things
 28 **Judicial proceedings** must beware of unanimity
 32 The gentleman is concerned for **principle**, not livelihood
 33 Sequence of **establishing relations with the people** in a state
 34 The gentleman is concerned for **great issues**, not small tasks
 35 Importance of **r'yn as a basic reliance of the people** in a state

[D. Official Colleagues]

- 37 An officer should be **faithful but not supine**
 38 An officer should be **dedicted and not avaricious**
 40 There is no compromise with those who disagree on fundamentals

[E. Envoi: Courtly Practices]

- 41 The only virtue of an official communication is **that it communicate**
 42 The proper way to help a blind man is **to guide him step by step**

LY 1

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 1 contains **16 passages**, none of which immediately invites subdivision.

Form and Interpolations. It is clear that the usual 24-saying chapter model does not apply. Lau finds “a lack of internal organization” in LY 1, but notes that (with LY 8, and he might have added LY 19) it contains many disciple sayings.⁴⁴ These very disciple sayings may be the key to the chapter organization, since there is an obvious tendency for them to occur in alternation with sayings of Confucius. The inventory (the chapter number 1 has been suppressed in these formulas) is:

Confucius:	1,	3,	5–6,	8,	11,	14,	16
Disciples:	2,	4,	7,	9–10,	12–13,	15	

Evidently, if one saying were removed from each group of two, the remaining sayings would alternate between the Confucius and disciple sets. In content, the groups themselves split between governmental and personal-cultivation maxims:

Government:	5,	10,	12
Personal:	6,	9,	13

If one of these themes were inconsistent with the theme of the rest of the material, we would have a principle of elimination. Given the governmental focus of the five preceding chapters (LY 12–13, 2, 14–15), it might be expected that LY 1 would also be predominantly governmental. Instead, the only clearly governmental sayings are the three listed above (1:5, 10, 12) plus Confucius’s final 1:16. LY 1 thus breaks with its precursors. Since the chapter itself has been (conspicuously) preposed rather than (routinely) postposed in the book, it would seem that the compilers also recognized this. On the double criterion of formal and thematic fit, we may thus identify as interpolations the four sayings 1:5, 10, 12, and 16, leaving 12 original sayings, exactly half the normal complement, in which Confucian and disciple sayings systematically alternate. Once we reach this point, we may then notice that the disciples in the latter series form a probably intentional palindromic pattern:

Yǒudǔ / Dzǔngdǔ / Dǔ-syà / Dzǔngdǔ / Yǒudǔ / [Envoi: Dǔ-gùng]

Date. Of these three disciples, Waley has observed that the Dzǔngdǔ of this chapter is very different from that of LY 8, being much closer to the filial paragon Dzǔngdǔ of later times.⁴⁵ We may add that his colleague and predecessor Yǒudǔ is here also revived from earlier obscurity, as a spokesman for domestic virtues. In its context following LY 15, this abandonment of government seems to imply the withdrawal from court that was threatened in 15:1. This might have happened at the beginning of the new reign of Wǔn-hóu, who succeeded in 0302, his lower title hóu “Lord”⁴⁶ being a sign of outward domination (presumably by Chǔ, which was at this period expanding as an eastern power) which may also have affected the Confucians’ influence at the Lǔ court. Allowing time to recenter the Lǔ school on a personal rather than governmental basis, we might date LY 1 to **c0294**.

Compiler. This would bring us to the probable headship of the next name on the SJ 47 list, Dǔ-jǐng’s son **Dǔ-gāu** 子高.

⁴⁴Lau **Analects** 273.

⁴⁵Waley **Analects** 20.

⁴⁶This nomenclature is preserved in SJ 15 sv 0295 (Brooks **Princes**).

- 1 Confucius: It is the part of a gentleman not to resent **unemployment**
 - 2 Yǒudǔ: Domestic virtues are the basis of **public** virtues
 - 3 Confucius: Clever speech is **incompatible** with rǎn
 - 4 Dǔwēngdǔ: On constant self-examination for **compliance** with virtue
 - 6 Confucius: Cultivate domestic virtues, **then** polite accomplishments
 - 7 Dǔ-syà: The domestically virtuous do not **need** polite accomplishments
 - 8 Confucius: Basic qualities are the foundation of **political** culture
 - 9 Dǔwēngdǔ: Proper respect at funerals shows health of **popular** culture
 - 11 Confucius: True filiality only shows after the death of **one's** father
 - 13 Yǒudǔ: A dutiful daughter will be the best wife (in **another** clan)
- [Envoi: Education]
- 14 Confucius: The assiduous man has the true **love** of learning
 - 15 Dǔ-gùng: The ability to draw inferences is the **height** of learning

LY 1 Conspectus

(Note the ABAB pattern of speakers, superimposed on the AABB pairing pattern)

LY 16

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 16 contains **14 passages**, none of which (including the double statement 16:11 and 16:12, which seem to be meant as literarily single units) insistently suggests subdivision.

Form and Interpolations. As with LY 1, it is obvious that the 24-passage chapter module is not relevant to LY 16, which must therefore be analyzed *de novo*.

LY 16:1, which after *11:24¹ is the longest passage in the Analects, denounces two disciples who have failed to dissuade their ruler from his plan to attack a small neighbor state. As with LY 3, this vehemence suggests a reaction to a contemporary event. It is followed by two dynastic curses, predicting extinction for an evil state, which are emotionally if not formally compatible with 16:1. Next come several sayings organized by numerical category (the Three This and Nine That), a device which does not occur in earlier chapters, and is one criterion used by Tswēi Shù⁴⁷ to distinguish LY 16–20 as later than the rest of the book. These comprise 16:4–10, within which 16:9, though it can be *analyzed* as about three levels of learning ability, does not begin, as the others do, with a *label* to that effect. Eliminating it as formally inconsistent leaves six sayings in three formally well-defined pairs. Of the remainder, the last piece, 16:14, is a handlist of nomenclatural terms for the wives of rulers, and has nothing to do with the rest of the chapter (such bits of stray data are another of Tswēi's criteria for LY 16–20). For this reason, and given its suspicious position at the end of the chapter, we exclude it also. The remaining three group as 16:11–12 (on public virtues) and 16:13 (on the educational process). The latter cannot be an envoi to the preceding pair, and must be taken as a *chapter* envoi (unique in that previous chapter envois have had *two* passages).

The resulting layout then has five thematic sections, arranged in a palindromic 1-2-6-2-1 pattern, and totaling **12 passages**.

Date. The impending conquest which animates 16:1 may be the intended Chí conquest of Sùng, which took place in 0286; the 16:2–3 curses would then be responses to the *actual* conquest. It is implied by JGT #479, which purports to be a sample of it, that Chí prepared the conquest by portraying the King of Sùng as a monster of depravity.⁴⁸ Such a conquest would have nearly surrounded Lù, and threatened its own later absorption. In 0285, an alliance of states, responding to this change in the balance of power, attacked Chí, whose King Mǐn died as a fugitive. We may then plausibly assign the middle of the chapter to before 0287, 16:1 to the pre-conquest year 0287 itself, and 16:2–3 and any other finishing touches to **c0285**.

Compiler. This date implies the continued headship of **Dž-gāu**. Several features of this chapter resemble those of his LY 1, among them the use of a 12-passage rather than 24-passage form, a palindromic ground plan, and an envoi of one or two sayings on education. This recalls the self-cultivation theme of the final sections of the “classic” 05c Analects chapters. So does the reappearance of the 05c heads Yōudž and Dzvngdž, previously ignored or castigated by the Kǔng school. We note that in c0285, these two chapters, LY 1 and LY 16, one at its head and one at its tail, would have framed the entire Analects as it existed at that time.

⁴⁷So Lau **Analects** 264–268. Takeuchi **Rongo** 13 and 192–195 argues that LY 16–18 are late, but LY 19–20 are less so. Our results tend to support Tswēi and Lau.

⁴⁸Crump **Ts'e** #479; compare Waley **Three** 137–141 (PB 100–105).

[A. Against Impending Conquest]

- 1 Confucius assails Rǎn Chyóu and Dž-lù for not preventing it

[B. Dynastic Curses]

- 2 When **ministers usurp**, doom will come in five generations
 3 Since the **princely line lost power**, four generations have passed

[C. Numerical Listings]

- 4 Three profitable **and three unprofitable** friendships
 5 Three profitable **and three harmful** pleasures
 6 **Three missteps** of those who serve rulers
 7 **Three avoidances** of the gentleman
 8 Three things the gentleman **fears**
 10 Three things the gentleman **takes thought for**

[D. Disapproval of Actions]

- 11 **There are none** who labor in obscurity to advance the Way
 12 **There were none** to praise Chí Jǐng-gūng at his death

[E. Envoi: Education]

- 13 Ch'vn Kāng extracts three principles from Confucius's son Bwó-y'w

LY 16 Conspectus

(Compare the form of LY 1, preceding, which also has 12 passages)

LY 17

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 17 contains 24 passages, of which two (17:2, 17:8) have an internal “The Master said” incipit, and should be divided (as 17:2a/b and 17:8a/b), making **26 passages** in all.

Interpolations. The changes introduced into the standard Analects chapter form since it was established with LY 5 (c0470) have in turn complicated the task of detecting interpolations, functionally defined as passages which interrupt that form. Thus, 9:1 was identified as an interpolation in the first instance because it preceded the pair 9:2/3, creating a 1+2 pattern for which there was *at that time* no formal precedent, but the special form of LY 16 (see above), in which 16:1–3 as part of a palindromic ground plan have the pattern 1+2, has now created just this precedent. Earlier interpolations themselves, having become established in the experience of *later readers* as normal, may in principle sooner or later serve as precedents. Thus a passage interpolated between a pair, such as 3:5 (which we date to c0310), in the Lín Fàng pair 3:4/6 (originally c0342) might eventually establish the “split pair” as a valid, and compositionally available, formal device.

In the present chapter, it is formally likely, on the old criteria, that 17:5, which splits a verbally close pair, 17:4/6, on refusing office, is an interpolation, and that 17:7, which comes between that pair and the next without seeming to serve as an envoi to the former, is also an interpolation. Eliminating them leaves **24 passages** with familiar subpatterns of paired-saying sections ending with optional unpaired envois, together with a two-passage final envoi which, like those of LY 1 and 16, is on the general subject of education and educability. The overall character of this chapter is angry: it denounces those in office, darkly disapproves of what look like rival claims to virtue and textual expertise, and is glumly unoptimistic about the capacity of certain types of people for self-improvement. This conclusion is novel in that it echoes the theme of the pair 17:2a/b, and the echo in turn suggests that these two pairs were at one time the intended beginning and end of the chapter.

The most striking passages in the chapter are 17:4/6, in which Confucius *refuses* office under unsavory rulers, but with evident reluctance. Despite the formal completeness of the thematic layout as described above, it is hard not to compare this with 17:1, in which Confucius, equally reluctantly, is *persuaded* to serve. Quite apart from the fact that LY 18 will soon eloquently defend service under evil regimes as not only allowable but politically imperative, it seems that 17:1 records an acceptance of what was reluctantly refused in 17:4/6, and that it does so not as a later interpolation but as an afterthought to the chapter, one for which LY 16 has provided a formal precedent. We thus treat 17:1 as part of the chapter design, though a part which *stands outside* the original thematic groups.

Date. It is substantively obvious that LY 17 reflects a Confucian return to power under disreputable conditions. This might reflect the nominal downgrading of the new ruler Chǐng-gūng (who had succeeded in 0279) from Prince (gūng 公) to Lord (hóu 侯), again presumably under Chǔ pressure, thus creating a virtual satellite government in Lǔ which the culturalist and nationalist Confucians might well have regarded with distaste. If so, we may plausibly date LY 17 slightly later, to **c0270**.

Compiler. This date would put us in the second quarter of the 03c, and thus into the period of the probable headship of Dǐ-shùn 子慎, who would presumably have held that position until the dissolution of the Lǔ school, a consequence of the dissolution of the state of Lǔ itself, at the middle of the century.

- 1 Yáng Hwò persuades reluctant Confucius to take office
 [A. On Human Nature]
- 2a People start out close together and only later **diverge**
 2b Only the wisest and the stupidest cannot **change**
- 3 Confucius concedes that educating the public is valid
 [B. The Temptation to Serve]
- 4 Confucius **tempted by rebel** Gūngshān Fú-rǎu to serve; refuses
 6 Confucius **tempted by rebel** Bì Syì to serve; protests the need to refuse
 [C. An Educational Crisis]
- 8a Disciples urged to study **the Shĭ**
 8b Disciples urged to study **the first section of the Shĭ**
- 9 Ritual and music are more than **their outward implements**
 10 The dishonest lack the inward reality but have **the outward manner**
 11 The **rural magnates** are the thieves of virtue
 12 Telling higher truths **in the byways** is a waste of virtue
 [D. Denunciations]
- 13 Criticism of those **currently in office**
 14 Decline in character of **the common people**
 15 **Cleverness and beauty** seldom betoken rǎn (*repeated from 1:3*)
 16 **Garish new usages** are replacing classic ones
 17 Confucius would rather give his message **without words**
 18 Confucius gives the bearer of an unwanted gift **a nonverbal reply**
 19 Defense against **selfish economic objections** to three-year mourning
 20 Complaint of **sensuous and lazy** students
 21 **Criticizes to Dž-lù** an overemphasis on courage
 22 **Complains with Dž-gùng** about various sorts of depraved conduct
 [E. Envoi: Again on Human Nature]
- 23 Women and little people **are hard to deal with**
 24 One disliked in maturity **will always be so**

LY 17 Conspectus

(17:1 is a formal afterthought, and stands outside the original chapter design)

LY 18

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 18 contains 11 passages, of which 18:1 and 18:8 both contain an internal “The Master said” (18:1 has more precisely “Confucius said” 孔子曰). This seems to warrant their subdivision as 18:1a/b and 18:8a/b, bringing the chapter total to **13 passages**.

Interpolations. Seemingly analogous to 16:14, the piece of extraneous lore that was at some point appended to LY 16, are 18:1a (a list of virtuous Shāng dynasty personages), 18:2 (featuring a remark by Lyōusyà Hwèi), 18:8a (a list of various ancient worthies), 18:9 (a list of musicians who went from Lǚ to other states), 18:10 (a quotation from Jōu-gūng), and 8:11a (a rhyming list of Jōu dynasty personages), which crop up at both ends of LY 18. Like 16:14, these do not mention Confucius, and might be dismissed as stray matter lodged in the text due to lax housekeeping at Confucian headquarters. However, 18:1a and 18:11a are both followed by closely associated comments of Confucius, in 18:1b and 18:11b. This would seem to rule out any theory of adventitious addition, either here or (by symmetry) in LY 16. These passages must thus be part of the Analects, and since they are very close to each other in type, and equally distant from the remaining LY 18 passages in theme, we may regard them as a single group of concentric additions to LY 18. That interpretation reduces the original chapter to the **5 passages** 18:3–7.⁴⁹

Form and Content. 18:3–4 pair as vignettes from Confucius’s political career (showing him in even more exalted company than 15:1, though still ultimately unsuccessful). The remaining three pieces, 18:5–7, are all criticisms of Confucius by recluses of a type familiar from the Jwāngdž. Of them, 18:5 has a counterpart in JZ 4:7 that is verbally identical except for the ending, and 18:7 has a close parallel in JZ 25:6.⁵⁰ The longer 18:6, which falls between them, has no equally close Jwāngdž counterpart. By earlier precedent, it would for that reason be suspected of being intrusive in the closely related 18:5/7 pair, but given its common theme, it can also be argued that it serves as the animating centerpiece in the 18:5–7 trio. This would mean that the compiler is using as a compositional model the split pair that arose from interpolations like that in the Lín Fàng area (3:4–6) of LY 3. A yet more relevant model, for this series and the whole chapter, is LY 8 as its central Dzvngdž portion would have looked (8:3–5, 8:6–7) after the addition of the second deathbed scene, *8:4¹⁶. By our theory of LY 8 (see above), there was never a time when the chapter *as a whole* had that aspect (we date the 8B¹⁴ concentric accretions earlier than *8:4¹⁶), but it is plausible that for later compilers, as for modern readers, the Dzvngdž core remained visible as such.

Date. There are no seeming references to contemporary events, and in the absence of an established dating for the different parts of the Jwāngdž, the close relations of LY 18 with JZ 4 and JZ 25, among other segments, do not yield a date. We may provisionally date LY 18 halfway between LY 17 and LY 19, or **c0262**.

Compiler. This falls in the quarter-century which is likely to have been that of the headship of **Dž-shv̄n**, and since SJ 47 tells us that Dž-shv̄n continued his career in Ngwèi, it would seem that he was himself displaced by the Chǔ conquest of Lǚ, and thus that he continued as Lǚ school head as of this *and all succeeding* chapters.

⁴⁹Kimura **Kōshi** 449f identifies these same passages as later additions.

⁵⁰Waley **Analects** 21 and Lau **Analects** 268–269 note this series as Dàuist in tone.

18A

18B

[Ancient Lore Addendum]

- 1a Virtuous Shāng dynasty personages
- 1b Confucius **comments** on the 18:1a personages
- ┌ 2 Remark of the scrupulous Lyǒusyà Hwèi

[Original Chapter]

- 3 Chí Jǐng-gūng cannot use Confucius; Confucius **leaves Chí**
- 4 Chí distracts Lǚ ruler with dancing girls; Confucius **leaves Lǚ**
- 5 Madman Jyé-yǐw berates Confucius for serving; **flees** when confronted
- 6 Confucius **eloquently affirms** to hermit farmers his duty to humankind
- 7 Old farmer derides Confucius for unnatural life; **flees** when confronted

- └ 8a Virtuous ancient personages from various periods
- 8b Confucius **comments** on the 8a personages
- 9 Exodus of **Lǚ** court musicians to various places
- 10 Remark of Jōu-gūng to **Lǚ-gūng**
- 11 Rhyming list of Jōu personages

LY 18 Conspectus

(Compare the LY 8 conspectus, above, and note here the primary triplet 18:5–7)

LY 19

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 19 contains **25 passages**, none of which suggests subdivision.

Form and Interpolations. As we approach the end of the text, there is very little time left between the date of the chapter and the cutoff date for the Analects as a whole. The total number of 25 passages suggests that we have here to deal with the standard 24-passage model, and at the same time, fortunately, that we are to suspect only one potential interpolation within that model.

It does not help to notice that there are disciple sayings, since it turns out that the entire chapter consists of nothing but disciple sayings. We next turn to the formal layout of the chapter, which is generally organized by the disciples. Thus, 19:1–3 are sayings of Dž-jāng, and 19:4–13 are sayings of Dž-syà; so also Dž-yóu in 19:14–16, Dzṽngdž in 19:17–19, and Dž-gùng in 19:20–25. It will be seen that this more precise rule also yields no exceptions. Finally, we may notice that the Dž-jāng section ends with a criticism of Dž-syà (19:3), who is the disciple featured in the following section. This would also be true of the Dž-syà section if it ended with 19:12 (which criticizes Dž-yóu, whose section follows). Instead, it ends with 19:13, which is about the balance of study and official employment. 19:13 thus interrupts this sectional linking device (which ends with 19:15–16, where Dzṽngdž closes the circle by criticizing Dž-jāng; later sections are not linked in this way), and is the needed interpolation. Eliminating it yields the expected **24 passages**.

Content. The three circularly interlocked sections have a palindromic 3-9-3 ground plan. The next section, that featuring Dzṽngdž, ends (in 19:19) by asking for forbearance about the evidences of cultural decay in Lǔ, a theme which is picked up by the first Dž-gùng saying (19:20), where it is also noted that the myths of ancient depravities are also greatly exaggerated. The Dž-gùng section reaches, and ends on, a plateau of eulogy for Confucius as beyond all cavil and comparison the greatest of sages, an all but heavenly personage. It seems evident that the last two sections are intended to lead out of the mutual disparagements of the circular set of the first three sections, into an affirmation that Confucius is the answer to both doctrinal and larger social questions.

Date. Disciple sayings have been part of the Analects repertoire since LY 1, which featured them structurally, but this exclusive *focus* on disciples is remarkable. It is further to be suspected that the mutual wrangling portrayed in the first three sections is somehow symbolic of inter-Confucian disputes, and that the exit from that wrangling into a renewed centering on Confucius, in the last two sections, amounts to a recommendation of harmony for all factions. The three wrangling sections seem to criticize emphases that were characteristic of the school of Sywǹdž, and the chapter may thus be an appeal for unity against the divisive stance of Sywǹdž, who in SZ 6 (Knoblock **Xunzi** 224 and 303n48 argues against this reading) had severely criticized “Dž-sž and Mencius,” that is, the Analectal and Mencian schools, and whose intolerance for what he called partial or divergent views is abundantly reflected throughout the preserved writings of the Sywǹdzian school. In the wake of the 0255/0254 Chǔ partial conquest, Sywǹdž had become Director of Lán-ling, in southern Lǔ, presumably with influence over unoccupied northern Lǔ, including the capital where the Analects school was located. As a response to this new intellectual overlordship, LY 19 may plausibly be dated to **c0253**.

Compiler. As argued above, this must still have been **Dž-shṽn**.

[A. Dž-jāng]

- 1 The **true officer** is brave, honest, and reverent in mourning
- 2 Those **partly committed** to virtue are neither with you nor against you
- 3 Dž-jāng criticizes Dž-syà [see next section] on how to treat outsiders

[B. Dž-syà]

- 4 A **superfluity of knowledge** only hinders the gentleman
- 5 He who knows **what he lacks** is the true lover of learning
- 6 The **reflective** student will incidentally achieve rǎn
- 7 The **assiduous** gentleman will perfect himself in the dào
- 8 The **little man** tends to overelaborate
- 9 The **gentleman** has three outer aspects
- 10 The gentleman toward **subordinates and superiors**
- 11 The gentleman toward **major and minor matters**
- 12 Dž-syà criticizes Dž-yóu [see next section] on sequence in teaching

[C. Dž-yóu]

- 14 Mourning should not be carried **beyond the point of grief**
- 15 Doing “what is difficult” does not **reach as far as rǎn**
- 16 Dzǎngdž criticizes Dž-jāng [see first section] for his pomposity

[D. Dzǎngdž]

- 17 Has heard Confucius speak of the moral dimension of **mourning**
- 18 Has heard Confucius praise **posthumous respect for father**
- 19 Dzǎngdž urges compassion for evidences of cultural decay

[E. Dž-gùng]

- 20 Defends ancient ruler against **exaggerated atrocity myths**
- 21 Notes that shortcomings of gentleman **will be widely known**
- 22 Extols Confucius’s learning as **too subtle for ordinary perceptions**
- 23 Extols Confucius’s character as **too profound for ordinary eyes**
- 24 Disparagement of Confucius **only reflects badly on the critic**
- 25 Disparagement of Confucius **makes the critic look like a fool**

LY 19 Conspectus

(Note the cyclic linkages at 19:3, 19:12, and 19:16)

LY 20

Chapter Inventory. The concordance text of LY 20 contains **3 passages**. It is well known that the Lǔ text (the one largely favored by scholars during Hàn, and chosen to be engraved on stone at the end of Hàn) lacked the third of these,⁵¹ which is included in our present text on the authority of the Gǔ or old-script text, supposedly recovered in early Hàn from the wall of “Confucius’s house” (in our view, rather the headquarters of the late Lǔ school, near to the Lǔ palace complex). The HS 30 description of the Gǔ text notes that it had not 20 but 21 chapters, with “two Dǔ-jāng.” That is, besides the present LY 19, which begins with a Dǔ-jāng saying, there must have been another chapter division with that incipit. 20:1 is an archaizing piece in the style of a Shū document. By quotes from and descriptions of ancient rulers it presents the evolution of the ideal model of civil government; it does not mention Confucius, and has been felt to be more or less extraneous to the Analects by several scholars.⁵² We see it as an essential statement of late Confucian political theory, which, like the lore passages in LY 16 and 18, is part of the text, but if it originally formed a separate division (in effect, LY 20) *within* the text, then the remaining 20:2–3 would have been a chapter of their own. That chapter would have had a Dǔ-jāng incipit, since he is the interlocutor in the first passage.⁵³

On the authority of this presumably original copy of the work, we should then regard 20:1 as constituting “LY 20” and 20:2–3 as “LY 21.” We have been dissuaded from numbering the passages this way by our decision to keep the chapter numbers of the received text. Instead, we have adopted the anomalous solution of treating 20:1 as an addendum to LY 19. As an interpolation, it thus has the formula 20:1¹⁹, for whose illogical aspect we apologize herewith. As a gesture to the other solution, these sequences appear as “LY 20” and “LY 21” on the conspectus, opposite.

Interpolations. Within the meaning of the chapter-division problem discussed above, none of the concordance passages are *later* interpolations, giving the received LY 20 a complement of **3 passages**. LY 20:1, anomalously but consistently, has been treated as an *interpolation after* (it is more precisely a *sequel to*) LY 19.

Form. LY 20:1 is a single, separate, pseudo-archaic document. The barely begun next chapter is represented by LY 20:2–3. For present purposes these can be regarded as paired (they discuss the minister and the gentleman), but they are of enormously different length, and were more likely raw material which the compiler had begun to accumulate, and would eventually have arranged more convincingly. As they stand, these passages are *preliminary to* the intended chapter form.

Date. The manifest interruption of LY 20 (or, if one follows Gǔ, LY 21) early in its process of accumulation implies a catastrophe. By far the likeliest catastrophe is the final conquest and absorption of northern Lǔ by Chǔ, in **0249**.

Compiler. By earlier argument, this was **Dǔ-shèn**. The SJ 47 report of his Ngwèi ministership, relied upon above to infer that he was head *until* 0249, also implies that he left Lǔ *after* 0249, and that the school ceased to function as an organization. Its heritage after that date will thus have been in the care of individuals in Lǔ.

⁵¹For the end of the Lǔ text at 20:2, see Mǎ **Shǐ Jīng** fragment 513.

⁵²Waley **Analects** 21, Lau **Analects** 201 n1, 268.

⁵³Waley **Analects** 252 also notes the separation of 20:1 and 20:2–3 in Gǔ.

[The Original LY 20; Complete as a Unit]

1 [Treatise on government in the form of an archaic document]

[The Original LY 21: Preliminary Sketches]

- 2 Dž-jāng asks about the characteristics of a **minister**; gets long reply
- 3 Confucius briefly characterizes the **gentleman**

LY 20 Conspectus

(Shown here, according to the Gǔ text, as a finished LY 20 and an incipient LY 21)

A Final Note on Form

This concludes our survey and analysis of the individual Analects chapters. It demonstrates that the rough hypothesis developed at the beginning of this Appendix can be developed in detail without manifest inconsistency, and to that extent lends support to the hypothesis.

As a by-product, the demonstration seems also to establish that there is a structure to Analects chapters, in which a set of formal elements like pairing and sectional division, some of them present from the beginning and others developed during the life of the text, are combined in different ways, and with what look like different personal predilections, to produce a standard chapter form and a number of variants on that form, as well as some highly individual departures from it, typically at moments of external challenge. The fact that the discovery procedures for these chapter forms do not give identical results for all chapters would seem to show that the reported forms are not analytically imposed, and at the same time that devices of form were used imaginatively and not routinely by the several compilers or authors. The possibility of statements being made through the medium of form is also open. One might regard the four *passages* of the LY 8 Dzṽngdž memorial as a respectful allusion to the four *sections* of the LY 4 Confucius memorial. Similarly, the 12-passage chapters LY 1 and 16 are of interest in that they may well have been from the same hand, and were together meant to frame and recontext the entire preceding Analects. Beyond this, their 12-passage form may be an intentional halving of the then normal 24-passage form, saying in effect (of the domestic focus which in them replaces the previous courtly focus) that in isolation from politics, a virtue of merely domestic scope is humanly incomplete.

We may here recapitulate the chapter profiles arrived at by this analysis:

LY 4	7- 3	3- 3	c0479	Dž-gùng	16 passages
LY 5	3- 9	9- 3	c0470	Dž-yóu	24 passages
LY 6	3-11	3- 7	c0460	Yóudž	24 passages
LY 7	5- 7	9- 3	c0450	Dzṽngdž	24 passages
LY 8	2- 2		c0436	Dzṽng Ywǎn	4 passages
LY 9	3- 8	10- 3	c0405	"	24 passages
LY 10	5- 8	6- 5	c0380	Dž-sž	24 passages
LY 11	3- 8	8- 3 -2	c0360	Dž-shàng	24 passages
> LY 3	3- 4	6- 6 -5	c0342	Dž-jyā	24 passages
LY 12	5- 4	7- 6 -2	c0326	Dž-jīng	24 passages
LY 13	6- 5	5- 6 -2	c0322	"	24 passages
> LY 2	4- 4	10- 4 -2	c0317	"	24 passages
LY 14	6- 7	4- 5 -2	c0310	"	24 passages
LY 15	3- 8	8- 3 -2	c0305	"	24 passages
> LY 1	10	-2	c0294	Dž-gāu	12 passages
LY 16	1- 2	6- 2 -1	c0285	"	12 passages
LY 17	1- 3- 2	6-10 -2	c0270	Dž-shv̄n	24 passages
LY 18	2- 3		c0262	"	5 passages
LY 19	3- 9	3- 3 -6	c0253	"	24 passages
LY 20	1 2		c0249	"	3 passages

The total number of passages in these original structures is 388. Together with the 142 interpolations distinguished by the above argument, this gives 530 passages for the Analects as a whole, the interpolations thus comprising 27% of that whole.